

LEGAL AFFAIRS DIVISION

1625 N. Market Blvd., Suite S 309, Sacramento, CA 95834 P (916) 574-8220 F (916) 574-8623 | www.dca.ca.gov



MEMORANDUM

DATE	February 6, 2017
то	Executive Officers, Executive Directors, Registrar, Bureau Chiefs, Interested Parties
FROM	Doreathea Johnson, Deputy Director & Chief Counsel Legal Affairs Division
SUBJECT	Public Meetings Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act Guide

The attached guide includes all statutory amendments to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, through January 1, 2017. Please disregard all previous guides to the Bagley-Keene Act, issued by the Legal Affairs Division.

There are three changes that took effect during 2016:

- 1. Section 11121 was amended to include the State Bar of California as a "state body" subject to the Bagley Keene Open Meeting Act (Act), commencing April 1, 2016. Accordingly, the State Bar is subject to the Act, notwithstanding the exclusion provided for in section 11121.1.
- 2. To ensure that non-English speakers have the same opportunity to address the state body during public comment when state bodies place a time limit on the time for public comment, section 11125.7 was amended, to require the state body to allow additional time for a member of the public, who uses a translator, unless the state body utilizes simultaneous translation equipment.
- 3. Section 11125.8 was amended, effective June 27, 2016, to provide that any hearings, conducted pursuant to section 13963.1 are conducted by the California Victim Compensation Board, and neither the applicant nor the applicant's representative request that the hearing be open to the public, the applicant's identity is not required to be placed on the notice, agenda, announcement or report. However, in such hearing, the board shall disclose that the hearing is being held pursuant to section 13963.1. This disclosure will satisfy the disclosure requirements of section 11126.3(a).

We hope that this document is helpful to you in answering questions you may have regarding the requirements of the Open Meeting Act. Please let us know if you have questions or suggestions for improvements to the guide.

cc: Awet Kidane, Director
Jeff Mason, Chief Deputy Director
Attorneys – Legal Affairs Division

GUIDE TO THE

BAGLEY-KEENE OPEN MEETING ACT

(Includes Amendments through January 1, 2017)

Prepared by:

DIVISION OF LEGAL AFFAIRS
Department of Consumer Affairs
1625 N. Market Blvd., Suite S 309
Sacramento, CA 95834
(916) 574-8220

This document may be copied if all of the following conditions are met: the meaning of the copied text is not changed; credit is given to the Department of Consumer Affairs; and all copies are distributed free of charge.

BAGLEY-KEEN OPEN MEETING ACT

Table of Contents

Subject		
l.	Public Policy to Conduct People's Business Openly	1
II.	Board, Committee, Subcommittee, Task Force Meetings A. Definition of a "Meeting" B. Exemptions from Definition of Meeting C. Board and Committee Meetings	2-4 2 2-3 3-4
III.	 Types of Meetings; Purpose; Notice; Other Requirements A. Regularly Scheduled Meetings Who May Hold a Regularly Scheduled Meeting Purposes for Which the Meeting May be Held Notice Requirements for a Regularly Scheduled Meeting Board Meetings Committee, Subcommittee or Task Force Meetings Specific Requirements for Regularly-Scheduled Meeting Specific Prohibitions on Holding a Regularly-Scheduled Meeting Special" Meetings Who May Hold a Special Meeting Purpose for Which a Special Meeting May be Held Notice Requirements for a Special Meeting Specific Requirements During Special Meeting Specific Prohibitions on Holding a Special Meeting Emergency" Meetings Who May Hold an Emergency Meeting Purposes for Which an Emergency Meeting Specific Requirements for an Emergency Meeting Specific Requirements for an Emergency Meeting Specific Prohibitions on Holding an Emergency Meeting 	4-11 4-8 4 4 5-7 5-7 8 8 8-10 8 8-9 9-10 10 10 10-11 10 11 11
IV.	Closed Sessions A. Purposes for Which Closed Session Can be Held 1. Personnel Matters 2. Examination Matters 3. Matters Affecting Individual Privacy 4. Administrative Disciplinary Matters 5. Board of Accountancy Matters 6. Pending Litigation 7. Response to Confidential Final Draft Audit Report 8. Threat of Criminal or Terrorist Activity 9. Advisory Bodies/Committees May Meet in Closed Session 10. Open Session Otherwise Required	11-18 11-16 12 12 13 13-14 14 14 14 15 15

Rev. 1/17 i

	B. Notice and Reporting Requirements for Closed Sessions1. Notice of Closed Session2. Reporting After A Closed SessionC. Other Procedural Requirements for Closed Sessions	15-16 15-16 16 16-17
V.	Meeting by Teleconferencing	17-18
VI.	Deliberations and Voting A. Seriatim Calls to Individual Agency Members Prohibited B. E-Email Prohibition C. Secret Ballot Prohibited D. Voting by Proxy Prohibited E. Use of Electronic Devices During Meeting F. Voting by Mail on Administrative Disciplinary Matters G. Recording and Reporting Votes	19-21 19 19-20 20 20 20 21 21-22
VII.	 Miscellaneous Provisions A. Conforming Board Member's Conduct B. Providing Open Meeting Act to New Board Members C. Prohibition on Placing Conditions on Public's Attendance Sign-in Discrimination in Admittance to Meeting Facility Access for the Disabled Charging a Fee or Requiring a Purchase for Access D. Agency Recording of the Proceedings Public's Right to Record the Proceedings Media Broadcast of the Proceedings Webcasting Taking Agenda Items Out of Order Opportunity for Public Comment at Meetings 	21-23 21 21-22 21 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 23 23
VIII.	Disclosure of Documents A. Documents Distributed Prior to the Meeting B. Documents Distributed During the Meeting C. Charging a Fee for Public Documents	24 24 24 24
IX.	Penalties	24-25

Rev. 1/17 ii

GUIDE TO THE BAGLEY-KEENE OPEN MEETING ACT

(Includes Amendments through January 1, 2017)

This guide is an update on the provisions of the public meetings law governing state agencies, officially called the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act. (Article 9 (commencing with Section 11120), Chapter 1, Part 1, Division 3, Title 2 of the Government Code). The Open Meeting Act closely parallels the Ralph M. Brown Act, which governs meetings of local government agencies. This guide includes all statutory changes through January 1, 2017. Please disregard all previous Guides to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act (distributed prior to January 15, 2017) on this subject.

All statutory references are to the Government Code.

I. PUBLIC POLICY TO CONDUCT PEOPLE'S BUSINESS OPENLY

Section 11120 sets forth the purpose of the law:

"It is the public policy of this state that public agencies exist to aid in the conduct of the people's business and the proceedings of public agencies be conducted openly so that the public may remain informed.

In enacting this article the Legislature finds and declares that it is the intent of the law that actions of state agencies be taken openly and that their deliberation be conducted openly.

The people of this state do not yield their sovereignty to the agencies which serve them. The people, in delegating authority, do not give their public servants the right to decide what is good for the people to know and what is not good for them to know. The people insist on remaining informed so that they may retain control over the instruments they have created.

This article shall be known and may be cited as the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act."

Each board has essentially three duties under the Open Meeting Act. First, to give timely and sufficient public notice of meetings to be held. Second, to provide an opportunity for public comment. Third, to conduct such meetings in open session, except where a closed session is specifically authorized. We use the terms "agency" and "board" to mean not only boards, but also commissions and any examining committees or boards within the jurisdiction of the Medical Board of California.

Section 11121 defines the "state body" that is subject to the Bagley Keene Act.
Unless specifically excluded by statute, a "state body" is defined as a state board,
commission or similar multimember body of the state that is created by statute or required by
law to conduct official meetings and every commission created by executive order; or a

board, commission committee or similar multimember body that exercises any authority, delegated to it by that state body; or an advisory commission, an advisory board, advisory committee, advisory subcommittee or similar multimember advisory body of a state body, if created by formal action of the state body or any member of the state body, and if the advisory body so created, consists of three or more persons. Effective April 1, 2016, the definition of "state body" was amended to include the State Bar of California, as described in Section 6001 of the Business and Professions Code. Notwithstanding subdivision (a) of section 11121.1, amended effective April 1, 2016, the State Bar is subject to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act and the California Public Records Act. (§ 11121(e))

II. BOARD, COMMITTEE, SUBCOMMITTEE, TASK FORCE MEETINGS

A. Definition of a "Meeting"

"Meeting" is defined in the Act as including "any congregation of a majority of the members of a state body at the same time and place to hear, discuss, or deliberate upon any item that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state body to which it pertains." (§11122.5(a)) The law now prohibits use by a majority of the members of a state body of direct communications or a series of communications of any kind, directly or through personal intermediaries, or technological devices (such as e-mails) to discuss, deliberate, or take action on any item of business that is within the subject matter of the state body. (§11122.5(b) (1).

B. Exemptions from Definition of Meeting

The law recognizes that not all gatherings of a majority of members of a state body at a single location constitute a meeting. Current law provides that the provisions of the Act do not apply to the following situations, **provided that** "a majority of the members do not discuss among themselves, other than as part of a scheduled program, business of a specified nature that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state body." (§11122.5(c))

- Individual contacts or conversations between a member of a state body and any other person. (§11122.5(c)(1))
- Attendance by a majority of members at a conference or similar gathering open to the
 public that involves a discussion of issues of general interest to the public or to public
 agencies of the type represented by the state body. (§11122.5(c)(2))
- Attendance by a majority of members at an open and publicized meeting organized to address a topic of state concern by a person or organization other than the state body. (§11122.5(c)(3))
- Attendance by a majority of members at an open and noticed meeting of another state body or of a legislative body of a local agency. (§11122.5(c)(4))
- Attendance by a majority of members at a purely social or ceremonial occasion. (§11122.5(c)(5))

 Attendance by a majority of members at an open and noticed meeting of a standing committee of that body, provided the members of the body who are not members of the committee attend only as observers. (§11122.5(c)(6))

The law does not, however, prevent an employee or official of a state agency from engaging in separate communications outside of a noticed meeting with members of the legislature to answer questions or provide information about a matter within the agency's subject matter jurisdiction – with the limitation that the person cannot communicate to members of the legislative body, the comments or position of any other member of the legislative body. (§11122.5(b)(2))

C. Board and Committee Meetings

There are two basic types of meetings held by agencies in the Department of Consumer Affairs. The first type is a board meeting, where a quorum of the members of the board is present. The second type is a committee meeting consisting of less than a quorum of the members of the full board. Subcommittee and task force meetings are variations of committee meetings.

Board meetings have historically been required to be noticed and open to the public, except where a closed session is authorized. Committee and subcommittee meetings, where less than a quorum of the board is present, are also required to be noticed and open to the public. The only exception is for a committee that consists of fewer than three persons and does not exercise any authority of a state body delegated to it by that state body. (NOTE – it is the number of <u>persons</u> on the committee [not the number of board members] that is determinative.)

Where a committee of fewer than three persons is to meet, and the meeting is not noticed, other members of the board should not attend the meeting, as such attendance would clearly be perceived as an Open Meeting Act violation. Board staff is not precluded from attending such a meeting.

[Restriction on Attendance at Committee Meetings] The law allows attendance by a majority of members at an open and noticed meeting of a standing committee of the board, provided the members of the board who are not members of the committee attend only as observers. (§11122.5(c)(6)) The Office of the Attorney General has addressed in a formal opinion a provision in the Brown Act relating to the attendance of "observers" at a committee meeting. The Attorney General concluded that "[m]embers of the legislative body of a local public agency may not ask questions or make statements while attending a meeting of a standing committee of the legislative body 'as observers." The opinion further concluded that such members of the legislative body may not sit in special chairs on the dais with the committee. (81 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 156)

Thus, under the provisions of section 11122.5(c)(6), and the opinion of the California Attorney General, if a majority of members of the full board are present at a committee meeting, members who are not members of the committee that is meeting may attend that meeting only as observers. The board members who are not committee members may not sit on the dais with the committee, and may not participate in the meeting by making statements or asking questions.

If a board schedules its committee meetings seriatim, and other board members are typically present to ultimately be available for their own committee meeting, your notice of the committee meeting should contain a statement to the effect that "Members of the board who are not members of this committee may be attending the meeting only as observers."

Subcommittees may be appointed to study and report back to a committee or the board on a particular issue or issues. If the subcommittee consists of three or more persons, the same provisions apply to its meetings as apply to meetings of committees.

Board chairpersons may occasionally appoint a task force to study and report on a particular issue. One or two board members typically serve as task force members, along with a number of other non-board members. When this is the case, the same Open Meeting Act rules that apply to committee meetings apply to task force meetings. Such a formally appointed task force falls under the definition of "state body" in Section 11121(c)."

III. TYPES OF MEETINGS; PURPOSE; NOTICE; OTHER REQUIREMENTS

Boards and committees may hold several types of meetings, including a regularly scheduled meeting, a "special" meeting, or an "emergency" meeting under the provisions of section 11125.5. This section of the memorandum addresses who can hold certain types of meetings, the purposes for which the meetings can be held, notice requirements, and any other special requirements or prohibitions.

A. Regularly Scheduled Meetings

1. Who May Hold a Regularly Scheduled Meeting

A board, committee, subcommittee, or task force may hold a regularly scheduled meeting. These are the business meetings that are scheduled throughout the year to conduct the usual and customary business of the board. Such meetings may generally be called by the chairperson, or by a majority of the body. However, you must refer to your particular licensing act, which may contain different provisions as to who may call a meeting.

2. Purposes for Which the Meeting May be Held

These meetings are to conduct the usual and customary business of the board, or the business of a committee, subcommittee or task force as directed by the board. The subject matter of the meetings is essentially dictated by the jurisdiction of the board as found in the board's licensing act. There are no statutory restrictions in the Open Meeting Act on the purposes for which a regularly scheduled meeting may be held.

3. Notice Requirements for a Regularly Scheduled Meeting

a. Board Meetings

An agency is required to give at least 10 calendar days written notice of each board meeting to be held. (§11125(a).) Effective January 1, 2015, an agency is authorized to provide that notice by regular mail, email or both. However, that same section requires an agency to give a person requesting notice the option of receiving the notice by regular mail, email or both and the agency must comply with that requester's choice for receiving notice of meetings. (Business and Professions Code section 101.7) The notice must include the name, address, and telephone number of a person who can provide further information prior to the meeting and must contain the website address where the notice can be accessed. The notice must also be posted on the Internet at least 10 calendar days before the meeting.

In addition to the website posting, effective January 1, 2003, the notice is required to be made available in appropriate alternate formats <u>upon request</u> by any person with a disability.

The notice of each board meeting must include an agenda that is prepared for the meeting. The agenda must include all items of business to be transacted or discussed at the meeting. "... A brief general description of an item generally need not exceed 20 words. ... No item shall be added to the agenda subsequent to the provision of this notice." (§11125(b)) This provision does not, however, preclude amending an agenda provided the amended notice is distributed and posted on the Internet at least 10 calendar days prior to the meeting. Effective January 1, 2003, the notice must include information that would enable a person with a disability to know how, to whom, and by when a request may be made for any disability-related modification or accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services. (§11125(f)) We suggest the following as standard language:

The meeting is accessible to the physically disabled. A person who				
needs a disability-related accommodation or modification in order to				
participate in the meeting may make a request by contacting				
at (916)	or sending a written request to that			
person at the Board [Address], Sa	cramento, California, [zip code].			
Providing your request at least five	(5) business days before the meeting			
will help ensure availability of the re	equested accommodation.			

The definition of "action taken" in Section 11122 is of some aid in determining what the Legislature intended by use of the words "items of business to be transacted."

"11122. As used in this article 'action taken' means a collective decision made by the members of a state body, a collective commitment or promise by the members of the state body to make a positive or negative decision or an actual vote by the members of a state body when sitting as a body or entity upon a motion, proposal, resolution, order or similar action." General agenda items such as "New Business," "Old Business," "Executive Officer's Report," "Committee Reports," "President's Report," "Miscellaneous," etc., without specifying the particular matters thereunder, lack sufficient specificity to meet the standards of the Open Meeting Act and cannot be used to circumvent the notice requirement of a specific agenda. The Office of the Attorney General has opined that:

"... the purpose of subdivision (b) [of Government Code Section 11125] is to provide advance information to interested members of the public concerning the state body's anticipated business in order that they may attend the meeting or take whatever other action they deem appropriate under the circumstances.

* * *

"We believe that Section 11125 was and is intended to nullify the need for . . . guesswork or further inquiry on the part of the interested public." (67 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 85, 87)

Items not included on the agenda may not be acted on or discussed, even if no action is to be taken by the agency. However, we offer two suggestions so members of the public and board members may raise issues that are not on the agenda.

We strongly encourage boards to include an item on their agendas for "Public Comment on Matters Not on the Agenda." This gives persons who are attending a meeting an opportunity to raise any issues they may have, which may not be on the agenda, but which may be appropriate for future board discussion. Matters raised under this agenda item should be discussed only to the extent necessary to determine whether they should be made an agenda item at a future meeting. (§11125.7(a))

It must be reiterated that no action may be taken on any such item and discussion is limited to that which is necessary to make the determination as to whether the item will be added to a future board agenda.

While neither the California Victim Compensation Board nor the Government Claims Board are within the Department of Consumer Affairs, any hearing conducted by either of these boards, pursuant to Section 13963.1 and neither representative requests the hearing be open to the public, the notice, agenda, announcement or report need not identify the applicant. (§11125.8)

We also strongly encourage boards to include an item on their agenda for "Agenda Items for Future Meetings." This allows all board members an opportunity to request specific agenda items for a meeting. Again, these items should be discussed only to the extent necessary to determine whether they should be included as agenda items for a future meeting.

[CAVEAT: If the regularly scheduled meeting will have a closed session agenda item or items, or be held by teleconference, please refer to the discussion of additional requirements under those headings, below.]

The notice and the agenda must be provided to any person who requests it. A member of the public may request notice for a specific meeting, for all meetings at which a particular subject will be discussed or action taken thereon, or for all meetings of the agency. Mailing lists of persons who desire to be notified of more than one meeting must be maintained pursuant to Section 14911, which provides:

"14911. Whenever any state agency maintains a mailing list of public officials or other persons to whom publications or other printed matter is sent without charge, the state agency shall correct its mailing list and verify its accuracy at least once each year. This shall be done by addressing an appropriate postcard or letter to each person on the mailing list. The name of any person who does not respond to such letter or postcard, or who indicates that he does not desire to receive such publications or printed matter, shall be removed from the mailing lists. The response of those desiring to be on the mailing list shall be retained by these agencies for one year."

Effective 1/1/98, a sentence was added to subdivision (c) of Section 11125.1 to state that "Nothing in this article shall be construed to require a state body to place any paid advertisement or any other paid notice in any publication." (Stats. 1997, Chapt. 949; SB 95) The Legal Office interprets this provision to supersede any provisions in particular practice acts which require newspaper publication of board or committee meetings. Boards and committees, of course, retain the discretion to publish notices in newspapers if they so choose.

b. Committee, Subcommittee or Task Force Meetings

Each agency is required to give notice of committee, subcommittee or task force ("committee") meetings to be held. However, this requirement does not apply if the committee consists of less than three persons. It is the <u>number of persons on the committee</u> that is determinative, not how many of the persons are board members. Thus, if a committee consisted of two board members and two other interested persons, its meetings would have to meet all the requirements of the Open Meeting Act.

Notice of committee meetings must be provided and posted on the Internet at least 10 calendar days in advance of the meeting. (§11125(a)) The notice "shall include a brief, general description of the business to be transacted or discussed, and no item shall be added subsequent to the provision of the notice." (§11125(c)) The notice must also include the Website address where the notice can be accessed on the Internet. Although the law does not so specify, we would suggest also including in the notice the name, address, and telephone number of a contact person who can provide further information prior to the meeting. As with board meetings, there is no requirement that the notice be published in any newspaper or other periodical. However, the notice must be provided to any person or persons who have requested to be notified of the particular committee's meetings. Effective January 1, 2015, an agency is authorized to provide that notice by regular mail, email or both. However, that same section requires an agency to give a person requesting notice the option of receiving the notice by regular mail, email or both and the agency must comply with that requester's choice for receiving notice of meetings. (Business and Professions Code section 101.7) You may elect to send such notice to those persons on your regular mailing list.

Remember, you must post your notice on the Internet at least 10 calendar days in advance of the meeting and must make the notice available in appropriate alternate formats upon request by any person with a disability.

Provision is made for certain non-emergency, but sometimes necessary, committee meetings. Where, during the course of a regularly scheduled and properly noticed board meeting, the board desires that a committee presently discuss an item of business on the agenda, the committee may do so provided (a) the specific time and place of the committee meeting is announced during the public meeting of the board, and (b) the committee meeting is conducted within a reasonable time of, and nearby, the meeting of the board. (§11125(c))

4. Specific Requirements for Regularly-Scheduled Meetings

There are no specific requirements, other than those set forth above, for regularly scheduled board, committee, subcommittee or task force meetings.

5. Specific Prohibitions on Holding a Regularly-Scheduled Meeting

There are no statutory prohibitions in the Open Meeting Act on a board, committee, subcommittee or task force conducting a regularly scheduled meeting.

We again remind you that, with respect to committee meetings, members of the board who are not members of the committee that is meeting may only attend the committee meeting as observers. This means these members may not sit on the dais with the committee, make any statements, or ask any questions during the committee meeting. (81 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 156)

B. "Special" Meetings

SB 95 of 1997 created a new category of meeting, identified as a "special" meeting.

1. Who May Hold a Special Meeting

A board, committee, subcommittee or task force may hold a special meeting.

2. Purposes for Which a Special Meeting May be Held

The only purposes for which a special meeting may be held are set forth in section 11125.4, and are drawn from the purposes for which an emergency meeting could be held under the prior law. In essence, the Legislature recharacterized those purposes as constituting "special" circumstances rather than "emergency" circumstances. Section 11125.4 provides in part that:

- "(a) A special meeting may be called at any time by the presiding officer of the state body or by a majority of the members of the state body. A special meeting may only be called for one of the following purposes when compliance with the 10-day notice provisions of Section 11125 would impose a substantial hardship on the state body or where immediate action is required to protect the public interest:
- (1) To consider 'pending litigation' as that term is defined in subdivision (e) of Section 11126.
 - (2) To consider proposed legislation.
 - (3) To consider issuance of a legal opinion.
 - (4) To consider disciplinary action involving a state officer or employee.
 - (5) To consider the purchase, sale, exchange, or lease of real property.
 - (6) To consider license examinations and applications.
- (7) To consider an action on a loan or grant provided pursuant to Division 31 (commencing with Section 50000) of the Health and Safety Code.
- (8) To consider its response to a confidential final draft audit report as permitted by Section 11126.2.
- (9) To provide for an interim executive officer of a state body upon the death, incapacity, or vacancy in the office of the executive officer.

* * *"

Department of Consumer Affairs licensing boards would most likely hold a special meeting for the purposes set forth in subdivisions (1), (2), (3), (4), and (6).

3. Notice Requirements for a Special Meeting

A special meeting can be called at any time by the presiding officer or a majority of the members of the state body, provided the 10-day notice requirements of section 11125 "would impose a substantial hardship on the state body or where immediate action is required to protect the public interest." (§11125.4(a)) The only purposes for which the meeting can be held are those set forth above.

The normal 10-day advance notice is not required for special meetings. However, notice of the special meeting is required to be provided to each member of the state agency and to persons who have requested notice of the agency's meetings as soon as practicable after the decision to hold the meeting is made. Notice to members, newspapers of general circulation, and radio or television stations must be received at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. Notice to newspapers, radio and television stations is satisfied by providing

notice to all national press wire services. Notices to the general public may be given via appropriate electronic bulletin boards or other appropriate mechanisms. (§11125.4(b)) The notice must also be posted on the Internet at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting.

The notice must specify the time and place of the special meeting and the business to be transacted. In essence, an agenda would be prepared. No business other than that noticed may be transacted. Notice is required even if no action is subsequently taken at the meeting. (§11125.4(b)) The notice must contain the Website address where the notice may be accessed on the Internet.

[CAVEAT: If the special meeting will have a closed session agenda item or items, or be held by teleconference, please refer to the discussion of additional requirements under those headings, below.]

4. Specific Requirements During Special Meetings

At the commencement of a special meeting, the agency must make a finding in open session that providing a 10-day notice of the meeting would pose a substantial hardship on the agency, or that immediate action is required to protect the public interest. The specific facts constituting the hardship or need for immediate action must be articulated. This finding must be adopted by a two-thirds (2/3) vote of the agency members present, or if less than two thirds of the members are present, by a unanimous vote of the members present. Failure to adopt the finding terminates the meeting. The agency's finding must be made available on the Internet. (§11125.4(c))

5. Specific Prohibitions on Holding a Special Meeting

As discussed above, a special meeting may only be held for the purposes set forth in section 11125.4(b). Other than the limitation on the purposes of the meeting, there are no statutory prohibitions in the Open Meeting Act on a board, committee, subcommittee or task force conducting a special meeting.

C. "Emergency" Meetings

1. Who May Hold an Emergency Meeting

A board, committee, subcommittee or task force may hold an emergency meeting.

2. Purposes for Which an Emergency Meeting May be Held

As noted above, S.B. 95 of 1997 recharacterized a number of "emergency" situations as "special" situations. This resulted in the narrowing of situations for which an emergency meeting may be held. Section 11125.5 provides an emergency meeting may be held only in the case of an "emergency situation," defined as:

"(1) Work stoppage or other activity that severely impairs public health or safety, or both.

"(2) Crippling disaster that severely impairs public health or safety, or both." (§11125.5(b))

3. Notice Requirements for an Emergency Meeting

An emergency meeting may be held without complying with the 10-day notice requirement in Section 11125 or the 48-hour notice requirement in Section 11125.4. However, newspapers of general circulation, television and radio stations that have requested notice of meetings shall be notified of the emergency by telephone at least one hour before the meeting. If telephone services are not functioning, notice is deemed waived. The notice must be posted on the Internet as soon as practicable after the decision to call an emergency meeting has been made. However, newspapers, television and radio must be notified as soon as possible after the meeting of the fact of the meeting, its purpose, and any action taken. (§11125.5(c))

4. Specific Requirements for an Emergency Meeting

The following are required to be posted in a public place and on the Internet for a minimum of 10 days, as soon as possible after the emergency meeting:

- * Minutes of the meeting
- * A list of persons notified, or attempted to be notified, of the meeting
- * Any action taken at the meeting
- * A copy of the rollcall vote on action taken (§11125.5(d))

5. Specific Prohibitions on Holding an Emergency Meeting

As discussed above, an emergency meeting may only be held for the purposes set forth in section 11125.5(b).

IV. CLOSED SESSIONS

A. Purposes for Which Closed Session Can be Held

"Closed" sessions were formerly called "executive" sessions. Since all references in the Open Meeting Act have been changed from "executive" session to "closed" session, throughout this memorandum we will refer to such sessions as "closed" sessions.

Section 11123 states that "All meetings of a state body shall be open and public and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of a state body except as otherwise provided in this article."

Section 11126 sets forth those specific items of business which may be transacted in closed session. Only those enumerated items of business may be conducted in closed session. An agency in the Department may convene a closed session pursuant to Section 11126 for the following purposes:

1. Personnel Matters

A board may meet in closed session to "... consider the appointment, employment, evaluation of performance, or dismissal of a public employee or to hear complaints or charges brought against such employee by another person unless the employee requests a public hearing." In order to consider such disciplinary action or dismissal the "employee shall be given written notice of his or her right to have a public hearing ... which notice shall be delivered to the employee personally or by mail at least 24 hours before the meeting." (§11126(a)) If such a notice is not given any action taken during a closed session for the above reason is null and void. Once the public hearing has been held, the agency may convene into closed session to deliberate on the decision to be reached. (§11126(a)(4))

Prior to January 1, 1995, section 11126(a) did not apply to employees who were appointed to their positions, such as executive officers, executive directors, and registrars (referred to as "executive officer" for convenience). For example, any decision or deliberations made in the selection or dismissal of an executive officer previously had to be conducted in open session. (68 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 34.) However, with the enactment of SB 1316 (Stats. 1994, Chapt. 845) and SB 95 (Stats. 1997, Chapt. 949), a board can now meet in closed session to consider the appointment, employment, evaluation of, or dismissal of its executive officer, unless the executive officer requests a public hearing. (§11126(a)(1), (2)) SB 1316 supersedes the conclusion reached in 68 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 34. As noted above, once the public hearing has been held, the state body may convene in closed session to deliberate on the decision to be reached. (§11126(a)(4))

If the executive officer does not request a public hearing, he or she must be given the opportunity for a hearing in closed session. After the hearing, the executive officer should be excused from the closed session, and the board may then continue in closed session to deliberate on the decision to be reached. (§11126(a)(4))

Section 11126(a) is not to be interpreted to mean that a board is required to handle civil service personnel matters itself. Normally, this function of an agency is administered by its executive officer in conjunction with the Director of Consumer Affairs, who shares authority with respect to civil service personnel.

2. Examination Matters

A board may meet in closed session to "prepare, approve, grade or administer examinations." (§11126(c)(1)) Essentially, this includes any discussion regarding the actual content of examinations, and their reliability and validity. If an agency is perusing examination samples in order to choose one over the others, this may be done in closed session. On the other hand, if an agency is discussing, for example, the general logistics of administering an examination, then this would not be proper subject matter for a closed session. A basic rule is that if a meeting concerns the grading, specific content, validity of an examination, or examination security, then it can and should be conducted in closed session.

Also, an agency may hear appeals from examinees or re-review examinations in closed session as this would be included in the "grading" of the examination.

3. Matters Affecting Individual Privacy

A committee, consisting of less than a quorum of the full board, may meet in closed session to:

"... discuss matters which the [committee] has found would constitute an unwarranted invasion of the privacy of an individual licensee or applicant if discussed in an open meeting, ... Those matters may include review of an applicant's qualifications for licensure and an inquiry specifically related to the state body's enforcement program concerning an individual licensee or applicant where the inquiry occurs prior to the filing of a civil, criminal, or administrative disciplinary action against the licensee or applicant by the state body." (§11126(c)(2))

Thus, review by a committee (or subcommittee of an examining committee) of an applicant's qualifications for licensure could properly be done in a closed session. Also, for example, an enforcement committee could convene in closed session to discuss an inquiry related to a particular licensee or licensees prior to any action being filed.

<u>CAVEAT</u>: This closed session provision does not authorize such a review by the full board. Nor does it generally authorize a committee of a board to review complaints, investigation reports, or other information to determine whether disciplinary or other action should be filed against a licensee.

To ensure that board members render an impartial and fair decision in considering an Administrative Law Judge's proposed decision, board members are precluded from involving themselves in the investigation or prosecution phase of an action. (§11430.10 *et seq.*) The board's role is that of judge in the case. If a particular board member has any significant involvement in the investigative or prosecution phases, he or she must disqualify himself/herself from participation in the board's action relative to the proposed decision, and not attempt to influence any other board member regarding the decision. Legal counsel should be consulted before any enforcement actions are discussed with individual licensees, as such discussions may impact participation by the member in a final decision on a case (§11430.60), and may require disclosures under the provisions of the state's Administrative Procedure Act. (§11430.50)

Even though these committee meetings may consist entirely of subject matter proper for closed session they are required to be noticed as discussed above.

4. Administrative Disciplinary Matters

A board may meet in closed session to deliberate on a decision in an administrative disciplinary proceeding under the Administrative Procedure Act. (§11400, et seq.; §11126(c)(3)) In the closed session, the board may decide whether to adopt a Proposed Decision, review a transcript of a hearing and render a decision of its own, deliberate upon evidence heard by the agency itself, or consider a stipulation.

This section does not authorize an agency to convene into closed session for the purpose of assigning cases, *i.e.* deciding whether a case should be heard by a hearing officer alone or by the agency itself with a hearing officer. This section does not authorize an agency to convene into closed session to review investigation files or complaints. Members of boards that have the discretion to hear cases should not review pending complaints or investigation files for the reasons given above.

5. Board of Accountancy Matters

The enforcement advisory committee established by the State Board of Accountancy pursuant to Business and Professions Code Section 5020 may convene in a closed session to "consider disciplinary action against an individual accountant prior to the filing of an accusation." (§11126(f)(3)) And the qualifications examining committee established by that board pursuant to Business and Professions Code Section 5023 may convene in closed session to "interview an individual applicant or accountant regarding the applicant's qualifications."

As noted above, such administrative and examining committee meetings are required to be noticed as previously discussed in this memorandum.

6. Pending Litigation

A board may meet in closed session to confer with or receive advice from its legal counsel regarding pending litigation when discussion in open session concerning those matters would prejudice the position of the state body in the litigation. (§11126(e)(1)) Again, please note the very specific notice requirements discussed below when a closed session is to be held to discuss "pending litigation". Litigation means an adjudicatory proceeding before a court, administrative body, hearing officer or arbitrator. Litigation is considered to be pending if, (1) it has been initiated formally (e.g. a complaint, claim or petition has been filed) or (2) based on existing facts and circumstances and on the advice of its legal counsel, the state body believes there is significant exposure to litigation against it, or it is meeting to decide whether a closed session is authorized because of significant exposure to litigation or (3) based on existing facts and circumstances, the state body has decided or is deciding whether to initiate litigation. (§11126(e)(2))

The agency's legal counsel must submit a memorandum which complies with the requirements of Section 11126(e)(2)(C)(ii) prior to the closed session if possible, but no later than one week after the closed session. This document is confidential until the pending litigation has been finally adjudicated or otherwise settled. (§6254.25)

7. Response to Confidential Final Draft Audit Report

Section 11126.2 (added effective January 1, 2005) permits an agency to meet in closed session to discuss its response to a confidential final draft audit report from the Bureau of State Audits. However, once that audit report becomes final and is released to the public, the agency may only discuss it in <u>open</u> session.

8. Threat of Criminal or Terrorist Activity

Effective January 1, 2006, AB 277 (Chap. 288, Stats. 2005) authorizes an agency at a regular or special meeting to meet in closed session to consider "matters posing a threat or potential threat of criminal or terrorist activity against the personnel, property, buildings, facilities, or equipment, including electronic data, owned, leased, or controlled by the state body," where disclosure of those considerations could compromise or impede the safety or security of the described subjects. The law (Section 11126(c)(18)) requires the agency to authorize the closed session by a two-thirds vote of the members present at the meeting.

9. Advisory Bodies/Committees May Meet in Closed Session

To the extent a licensing board, which is defined as a "state body" in the Open Meeting Act, is authorized to meet in closed session, then committees, subcommittees, or other bodies advisory to the licensing board, which are also defined as "state bodies," may meet in closed session for the same purposes as the licensing board. (§11126((f), (4)-(6))

10. Open Session Otherwise Required

Any other business transacted by an agency must be in open session. Only for the above-mentioned reasons may a board within the Department of Consumer Affairs meet in closed session. (§11132) A board may not meet in closed session for the purpose of electing officers or to discuss the proposal or adoption of rules and regulations. Further, a board may not convene in closed session to discuss testimony received during a hearing on proposed rules and regulations. Finally, an agency may not meet in closed session because it wants to have a frank and open discussion among only members on a matter of controversy. In order for an agency to meet in closed session, the closed session must be specifically authorized by statute.

B. Notice and Reporting Requirements for Closed Sessions

1. Notice of Closed Session

When a closed session will constitute part or all of a meeting, it is important to note Government Code Section 11126.3, which requires that:

"(a) Prior to holding any closed session, the state body shall disclose, in an open meeting, the general nature of the item or items to be discussed in the closed session. The disclosure may take the form of a reference to the item or items as they are listed by number or letter on the agenda. [A provision applicable to the Public Utilities Commission is not included herein.] If the session is closed pursuant to subparagraph (A) of paragraph (2) of subdivision (e) of Section 11126 [litigation has already commenced], the state body shall state the title of, or otherwise specifically identify, the litigation to be discussed unless the body states that to do so would jeopardize the body's ability to effectuate service of process upon one or more unserved parties, or that to do so would jeopardize its ability to conclude existing settlement negotiations to its advantage."

Thus, if the meeting will consist in part or in its entirety of a closed session, you must include on the notice of the meeting the above-described information. Pay particular attention to these very specific requirements if the closed session is to discuss pending litigation. Please note that to obtain legal advice in closed session concerning pending litigation, the notice must cite subdivision (e) of Section 11126 and your attorney must prepare a memorandum stating the specific reasons and legal authority for the closed session. Subdivisions of Government Code Section 11126, discussed under "Closed Sessions" above, will generally be the statutory authority cited.

If a closed session agenda to discuss pending litigation has been properly published, and an additional pending litigation issue subsequently arises, the state agency may discuss the new matter in closed session provided that postponement of the discussion would prevent the state agency from complying with any statutory, court-ordered, or other legally-imposed deadline. The state agency must publicly announce the title of, or otherwise identify, the litigation unless to do so would jeopardize the ability to effectuate service of process, or to do so would jeopardize the agency's ability to conclude existing settlement negotiations to its advantage. (§11126.3(d))

If you intend to have a closed session during your meeting, you should first contact your Legal Division attorney to ensure that a closed session is authorized and properly noticed.

2. Reporting After a Closed Session

Section 11126.3(f), requires a state body to convene in open session after a closed session and to report as required in Section 11125.2, which states that:

"Any state body shall report publicly at a subsequent public meeting any action taken, and any rollcall vote thereon, to appoint, employ, or dismiss a public employee arising out of any closed session of the state body."

C. Other Procedural Requirements for Closed Sessions

There are certain additional requirements that must be met when closed sessions are to be held.

- 1. All closed sessions must be held <u>during a regular or special meeting</u> (§11128); they may not be scheduled independently of a noticed meeting of the board or committee. Where, for example, a board or committee meeting is scheduled to discuss only matters appropriate for a closed session, the meeting should be opened as a public meeting with an announcement immediately following that the agency will convene into closed session.
- 2. As discussed under "Notice Required," above, prior to holding the closed session the agency must <u>announce the general reason(s)</u> for the closed session <u>and</u> the specific statutory or other <u>legal authority</u> under which the session is held. (§11126.3 (a)) With respect to litigation that has already been initiated, it must announce the title of or otherwise identify the litigation. (§11126.3(a)) Other specific notice requirements, discussed above,

also apply to notices regarding pending litigation. In the closed session, only matters covered in the statement may be discussed. (§11126.3(b))

- 3. The agency is required to designate a <u>staff person to attend</u> the closed session and to <u>record in a minute book</u> a record of topics discussed and decisions made. (§11126.1)
- 4. The <u>minute book</u> referenced in (3) is <u>available only to members</u> of the agency, or if a violation of the Open Meeting Act is alleged, to a court of general jurisdiction. (§11126.1)
- 5. <u>Information</u> received and discussions held in closed session are **confidential** and <u>must not be disclosed to outside parties</u> by members or staff who attended the closed session. A recent opinion of the Office of the California Attorney General concluded that:

"A local school board member may not publicly disclose information that has been received and discussed in closed session concerning pending litigation unless the information is authorized by law to be disclosed." (80 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 231)

That opinion also cited a previous opinion, in which the Attorney General stated that "We have ... routinely observed that it would be *improper* for information received during a closed session to be publicly disclosed." (76 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 289, 290-291; Emphasis in the original.)

V. MEETING BY TELECONFERENCING

Prior to January 1, 1995, the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act contained no provision for conducting meetings where the participating members were not physically present in one location.

Effective 1/1/95, subdivision (b) was added to Government Code section 11123 to authorize meetings by teleconference. (Stats. 1994, Chapt. 1153; AB 3467) That subdivision has been amended several times, most recently by AB 192 of 2001, and it currently provides:

- "(a) All meetings of a state body shall be open and public and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of a state body except as otherwise provided in this article.
- "(b) (1) This article does not prohibit a state body from holding an open or closed meeting by teleconference for the benefit of the public and state body. The meeting or proceeding held by teleconference shall otherwise comply with all applicable requirements or laws relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding, including the following:
- (A) The teleconferencing meeting shall comply with all requirements of this article applicable to other meetings.

- (B) The portion of the teleconferenced meeting that is required to be open to the public shall be audible to the public at the location specified in the notice of the meeting.
- (C) If the state body elects to conduct a meeting or proceeding by teleconference, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations and conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the rights of any party or member of the public appearing before the state body. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. The agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the state body directly pursuant to Section 11125.7 at each teleconference location.
- (D) All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- (E) The portion of the teleconferenced meeting that is closed to the public may not include the consideration of any agenda item being heard pursuant to Section 11125.5.
- (F) At least one member of the state body shall be physically present at the location specified in the notice of the meeting.
- (2) For the purposes of this subdivision, 'teleconference' means a meeting of a state body, the members of which are at different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or both audio and video. This section does not prohibit a state body from providing members of the public with additional locations in which the public may observe or address the state body by electronic means, through either audio or both audio and video."

A method is thus available whereby meetings may be conducted by audio or video teleconferencing provided the criteria set forth in the statute have been met. Note the restriction in subdivision (b)(1)(E) that prohibits a closed session emergency meeting. Emergency meetings in open session may be conducted by teleconference.

Effective January 1, 2015, subdivision (c) was added to Government Code section 11123 to require that any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action be publicly reported by the state body. (Stats. 2014, Chapt.510; AB 2720)

We emphasize that the law now requires every teleconference meeting location to be identified in the notice and agenda and to be open to the public. Most importantly, the members of the agency must attend the meeting at a public location. Members are no longer able to attend the meeting via teleconference from their offices, homes, or other convenient location unless those locations are identified in the notice and agenda, and the public is permitted to attend at those locations. Nothing prohibits additional locations, where only the public is connected to the teleconference meeting. (§11123(b)(2))

VI. DELIBERATIONS AND VOTING

Keep in mind the Open Meeting Act declaration of legislative intent that actions of state agencies be taken openly and that their deliberation be conducted openly. (§11120) In this regard, there are a number of provisions in the Open Meeting Act which address deliberations and voting.

A. Seriatim Calls to Individual Agency Members Prohibited

Except as authorized by the above-discussed teleconferencing statutes, telephone conference calls may not be used to avoid the requirements of the Open Meeting Act. A conference call including members of a board, committee, subcommittee or task force sufficient to constitute a majority of that state body is prohibited, except pursuant to an authorized teleconference meeting.

In a case involving the Ralph M. Brown Act, the court concluded that a series of one-to-one telephone calls between members of a local body, where the purpose of the calls was to obtain a collective commitment on an issue, constituted a violation of the Act. (*Stockton Newspapers, Inc. v. Members of the Redevelopment Agency of the City of Stockton* (1985) 171 Cal.App.3d 95) The Brown Act is the local agency counterpart to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, and decisions rendered on its provisions are frequently followed in Open Meeting Act cases.

Citing the *Stockton Newspapers, Inc.* case, the court *in Sutter Bay Associates v. County of Sutter* held that to prevent evasion of the Brown Act, a series of private meetings (known as serial meetings) by which a majority of the members of the legislative body commit themselves to a decision concerning public business or engage in collective deliberation on public business would violate the open meeting requirement. ((1997) 58 Cal.App.4th 860, 877, 68 Cal.Rptr.2d 492, 502)

Effective January 1, 2010, the Act now specifically prohibits serial communications between a majority of members "to <u>discuss</u>, deliberate, or take action on any item of business that is within the subject matter of the state agency." (Emphasis added.) (§11122.5(b))

B. E-Mail Prohibition

Section 11122.5 was amended by Stats. 2009, c. 150 (A.B. 1494) to provide:

- (b)(1) A majority of the members of the state body shall not, outside of a meeting authorized by this chapter, use a series of communications of any kind, directly or through intermediaries to discuss, deliberate, or take action on any item of business that is within the subject matter of the state body.
- (2) Paragraph (1) shall not be construed to prevent an employee or official of a state agency from engaging in separate conversations or communications outside of a meeting authorized by this chapter with members of a legislative body in order to answer questions or provide information regarding a matter that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state

agency, if that person does not communicate to members of the legislative body the comments or position or any other member or members of the legislative body.

The enactment of subdivision (b) of section 11122.5, expands upon and confirms a recent opinion of the Attorney General prohibiting the use of e-mail to reach a collective decision outside a regularly scheduled meeting. In 84 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 30, the Attorney General concluded that:

"A majority of the board members of a local public agency may not email each other to develop a collective concurrence as to action to be taken by the board without violating the Ralph M. Brown Act even if the e-mails are also sent to the secretary and chairperson of the agency, the e-mails are posted on the agency's Internet website, and a printed version of each e-mail is reported at the next public meeting of the board."

As noted above, interpretations of the Brown Act, which governs local public agencies, are often cited as authority in interpreting similar provisions of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Members of a board must refrain from calling or otherwise contacting other members on a one-to-one basis, or conducting serial meetings, in order to discuss, deliberate, or take action outside the meeting on a matter within the subject matter of the board.

C. Secret Ballot Prohibited

An agency may not vote by secret ballot in a public meeting nor vote in closed session on any matter where discussion, deliberations, or action taken is required to be in an open meeting. (68 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 65, 69)

For example, the election of board officers may not be conducted by secret ballot or in closed session.

D. Voting by Proxy Prohibited

Voting by proxy is not authorized. (68 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 65, 70)

E. Use of Electronic Devices During Meeting

Board members should not text or email each other during an open meeting on <u>any</u> <u>matter within the board's jurisdiction</u>. Using electronic devices to communicate secretly on such a matter would violate the law. Where laptops are used by board members at the meeting because the board provides board materials electronically, the board president should make an announcement at the beginning of the meeting as to the reason for the laptops. We suggest the following (or something similar):

"You may notice board members accessing their laptops during the meeting. They are using the laptops solely to access the board meeting materials which are in electronic format."

F. Voting by Mail on Administrative Disciplinary Matters

As a general rule, all voting on items of business to be transacted must be done at a public meeting. However, the Administrative Procedure Act authorizes mail voting on all questions arising under that act. (Govt. Code §11526.) Thus, board members may vote by mail on proposed decisions, stipulated decisions, and other matters in connection with a formal disciplinary case. No other votes may be cast by mail. (68 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 65, 69)

G. Recording and Reporting Votes

Beginning January 1, 2015, for each item on which a vote is taken, the minutes must contain a record of how each member voted on that action item. (For example, Yes – Members A, B, & C; No – Members D & E; Abstain – Member F.)

VII. MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

There are several provisions governing public meetings which do not fit under any of the above headings, but of which you should be aware.

A. Conforming Board Member's Conduct

Any person who has been appointed as a member of a state body, who has not yet assumed the duties of the office, must conform his or her conduct to the provisions of the Open Meeting Act. (§11125.95

B. Providing Open Meeting Act to New Board Members

A copy of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act must be provided to each agency member upon his or her appointment to office. Each agency should insure that a copy is given to each new member. (§11121.9.)

C. Prohibition on Placing Conditions on Public's Attendance

1. Sign-in

No person can be required to register or sign-in or fulfill any other condition in order to attend a public meeting of an agency. While a person who wishes to make public comment may be asked to identify himself or herself for the board's record or minutes, a commenter cannot be compelled to do so or prevented from speaking because the commenter refuses to identify himself or herself.

If an attendance list, register, questionnaire, or other similar document is posted at or near the entrance to the room where the meeting is to be held, or is circulated to persons present during the meeting, "it shall state clearly that the signing, registering, or completion of the document is voluntary, and that all persons may attend the meeting regardless of whether a person signs, registers, or completes the document." (§11124)

2. Discrimination in Admittance to Meeting Facility

A meeting may not be held in any facility that prohibits the admittance of any persons on the basis of race, religious creed, color, national origin, ancestry, or sex. (§11131)

3. Access for the Disabled

All meetings must be accessible to the disabled. (§11131)

4. Charging a Fee or Requiring a Purchase for Access

The Open Meeting Act prohibits holding a meeting in any location where the public is required to pay a fee or make a purchase to attend. (§11131)

D. Agency Recording of the Proceedings

A tape or film record of an open and public meeting made by the agency must be made available for public inspection under the California Public Records Act, but may be erased or destroyed 30 days after the taping or recording. An inspection must be provided without charge on an audio or video tape player made available by the state agency. (§11124.1(b))

E. Public's Right to Record the Proceedings

Persons attending a public meeting have a right to record the proceedings with an audio or video tape recorder or still or motion picture camera, in the absence of a reasonable finding by the agency that the recording could not continue without noise, illumination, or obstruction of view that constitutes, or would constitute a persistent disruption of the proceedings. (§11124.1(a))

F. Media Broadcast of the Proceedings

A state body may not prohibit or otherwise restrict the broadcast of a public meeting in the absence of a reasonable finding that the broadcast cannot be accomplished without noise, illumination, or obstruction of view that would constitute a persistent disruption of the proceedings. (§11124.1(c))

G. Webcasting

Whether or not webcasting is required, if your meeting is webcast, it is our recommendation that you place the following statement on your agenda:

"While the board intends to webcast this meeting, it may not be possible to webcast the entire open meeting due to limitations on resources."

H. Taking Agenda Items Out of Order

Items listed on the agenda may be taken up out of order, provided the purpose of moving the agenda items is not to frustrate public or other input on the item. It is a good practice to note on either the top or the bottom of your agenda that "All times indicated and the order of business are approximate and subject to change," to alert members of the public this is a possibility.

If your agency schedules a multiple day meeting and may move items scheduled for a subsequent day to an earlier day, you should provide notice of this possibility on your agenda. Suggested language is that "Items scheduled for a particular day may be moved to an earlier day to facilitate the board's business." Again, the purpose may not be to frustrate public or other input.

I. Opportunity for Public Comment at Meetings

Section 11125.7 addresses the subject of public comment at board meetings. With specified exceptions, that section requires state agencies to provide an opportunity for members of the public to directly address the state agency on each agenda item before or during the agency's discussion or consideration of the item. This opportunity for comment need not be made available if:

- 1. The agenda item has previously been considered at a public meeting by a committee comprised exclusively of board members, where members of the public were provided an opportunity to address the item. However, if the item has been substantially changed since the committee meeting, a new opportunity to address the agency would be required at the full board meeting.
- 2. The agenda item is one that may properly be considered in closed session, which would include deliberation and action on disciplinary proceedings under the Administrative Procedure Act. (§11125.7)

If a board wishes to establish a standing rule that discussion of agenda items will be given a specified amount of time, or that public comment will be limited to a certain amount of time, the board may do that by adopting an administrative regulation. (§11125.7(b))

Section 11125.7 was amended, effective June 27, 2016 to provide an equal time provision when the state body limits the time for public comment, by requiring the state body to provide at least twice the allotted time to a member of the public who uses a translator. This amendment is to ensure that non-English speakers receive an equal opportunity to address the state body when simultaneous translation equipment is not used. (Stats of 2016 chapt. 31 SB 836)

The law specifically provides that a state agency may not prohibit public criticism of its policies, programs, or services, or of the acts or omissions of the agency. (§11125.7(c))

VIII. DISCLOSURE OF DOCUMENTS

A. Documents Distributed Prior to the Meeting

When writings which are public records are distributed to all, or a majority of all, of the members of a board or committee for discussion or consideration at a public meeting, the writings must be made available for public inspection. Generally, the records must be made available for inspection at the time of distribution to agency members. (§11125.1(a)) Records exempt from disclosure under Sections 6253.5, 6254 or 6254.7 of the Public Records Act need not be disclosed even though the subject matter of the records may be considered or discussed at the meeting. This includes records which are drafts, notes or memoranda which will not be retained by the agency, attorney-client privileged communications, records of pending litigation and claims against the state, personnel, medical or similar files, complaint and investigation files, except for Accusations and Proposed Decisions, and any records or data relating to examinations.

B. Documents Distributed During the Meeting

When public records pertaining to an agenda item are prepared by the state body or a member of the state body, and distributed to state body members during a meeting, the documents must be made available for public inspection at the meeting. If records are prepared by some other person, and distributed to members of the state body during a meeting, the documents must be made available for public inspection after the meeting. (§11125.1(b)) Records exempt from public disclosure under specified statutes are not required to be publicly disclosed. (§11125.1(a), (b))

C. Charging a Fee for Public Documents

Under section 11126.7, an agency may not charge a fee for a notice, including the agenda, of a meeting, and may only charge those fees specifically authorized for public documents that are considered at the meeting

At its discretion, an agency may charge a fee to cover reproduction costs for providing the documents required to be made available, as discussed in paragraph (B), immediately above. If an agency charges a fee, it is limited to the direct costs of duplication authorized in Section 6257 for the reproduction of public records. (§11125.1(c))

Effective January 1, 2003, documents distributed prior to or during a meeting that are public records must be made available, <u>upon request</u> by a person with a disability, in appropriate alternative formats. No extra charge can be imposed for putting those documents into an alternative format.

IX. PENALTIES

Under previous law, any interested person could commence court action (mandamus, injunction, declaratory relief) to stop or prevent violations or threatened violations of the Open

Meeting Act. SB 95, effective 1/1/98, added the Attorney General and the district attorney to the list of those who may commence such action. Court costs and reasonable attorney's fees may be awarded to a successful plaintiff to be paid from the funds of the agency. (§11130.5)

SB 95 also expanded the law to authorize the Attorney General, a district attorney, or any interested person to seek court action "to determine whether any rule or action by the state body to penalize or otherwise discourage the expression of one or more of its members is valid or invalid under the laws of this state or of the United States, ..." (§11130(a)) This appears to be a rather unique provision, and its implications are unknown at this time.

SB 95 further expanded the law to authorize the Attorney General, a district attorney, or any interested person to seek a court action to compel a state agency to tape record its closed sessions. Upon a judgment of a violation of Section 11126, a court could so compel an agency. Discovery procedures for the tape recordings are also set forth. (§11130(b), and (c))

Section 11130.3 authorizes a person to institute a court action to obtain a judicial determination that an action taken in violation of the notice provisions or the provisions governing closed sessions of the Act is null and void. Court costs and reasonable attorney's fees may also be awarded to a successful plaintiff under this section. This section reinforces the need for a specific, informative agenda as required by Section 11125.

These remedies extend to past actions of an agency. The statute of limitations for bringing an action is 90 days. (§§11130(c) and 11130.3(a)).

Section 11130.7 of the Act provides:

"Each member of a state body who attends a meeting of such body in violation of any provision of this article, and where the member intends to deprive the public of information to which the member knows or has reason to know the public is entitled, is guilty of a <u>misdemeanor</u>." (Emphasis added.)

11120. Public policy; legislative finding and declaration; citation of article

It is the public policy of this state that public agencies exist to aid in the conduct of the people's business and the proceedings of public agencies be conducted openly so that the public may remain informed.

In enacting this article the Legislature finds and declares that it is the intent of the law that actions of state agencies be taken openly and that their deliberation be conducted openly.

The people of this state do not yield their sovereignty to the agencies which serve them. The people, in delegating authority, do not give their public servants the right to decide what is good for the people to know and what is not good for them to know. The people insist on remaining informed so that they may retain control over the instruments they have created.

This article shall be known and may be cited as the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4333, § 4; Stats. 1981, c. 968, p. 3683, § 4.)

11121. State body defined

As used in this article, "state body" means each of the following:

(a) Every state board, or commission,

or similar multimember body of the state that is created by statute or required by law to conduct official meetings and every commission created by executive order.

- (b) A board, commission, committee, or similar multimember body that exercises any authority of a state body delegated to it by that state body.
- (c) An advisory board, advisory commission, advisory committee, advisory subcommittee, or similar multimember advisory body of a state body, if created by formal action of the state body or of any member of the state body, and if the advisory body so created consists of three or more persons.
- (d) A board, commission, committee, or similar multimember body on which a member of a body that is a state body pursuant to this section serves in his or her official capacity as a representative of that state body and that is supported, in whole or in part, by funds provided by the state body, whether the multimember body is organized and operated by the state body or by a private corporation.
- (e) Not withstanding subdivision (a) of Section 11121.1, the State Bar of California, as described in Section 6001 of the Business and Professions Code. This subdivision shall become operative on April 1, 2016.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1980, c. 515, § 1; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3683, § 5; Stats.1984, c. 193, § 38. Amended by Stats.1996, c. 1023 (S.B.1497), § 88, eff. Sept. 29, 1996; Stats.1996, c. 1064 (A.B.3351), § 783.1,

operative July 1, 1997; Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 1; Amended Stats. 2003 ch 62 § 117 (SB 600), Stats. 2015, c. 537 (S.B. 387), § 22, eff. January 1, 2016.)

11121.1. State body; exclusions

As used in this article, "state body" does not include any of the following:

- (a) Except as provided in subdivision (e) of Section 11121, state agencies provided for in Article VI of the California Constitution.
- (b) Districts or other local agencies whose meetings are required to be open to the public pursuant to the Ralph M. Brown Act (Chapter 9 (commencing with Section 54950) of Part 1 of Division 2 of Title 5).
- (c) State agencies provided for in Article IV of the California Constitution whose meetings are required to be open to the public pursuant to the Grunsky-Burton Open Meeting Act (Article 2.2 (commencing with Section 9027) of Chapter 1.5 of Part 1 of Division 2 of Title 2).
- (d) State agencies when they are conducting proceedings pursuant to Section 3596.
- (e) State agencies provided for in Section 109260 of the Health and Safety Code, except as provided in Section 109390 of the Health and Safety Code.
- (f) The Credit Union Advisory Committee established pursuant to Section 14380 of the Financial Code.

(Added by Stats. 2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 2. Amended by Stats. 2008, c. 344 (S.B. 1145), § 2, eff. Sept. 26, 2008; Stats. 2015, c. 537 (S.B. 387), § 23, eff. January 1, 2016.)

11121.2. Repealed by Stats. 2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 3

The repealed section, added by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3684, § 5.2, provided the additional definition of "state body" as a multimember body with authority of state body.

§ 11121.5. Repealed by Stats.1984, c. 1158, § 3

The repealed section, added by Stats.1994, c. 1179, § 1, amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, § 5.3; Stats.1983, c. 143, § 186, Stats.1983, c. 101, § 60, related to the treatment of state college and university student body organizations as state agencies. Similar provisions were added at Education Code § 89920 et. seq.

11121.7. Repealed by Stats. 2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 4

The repealed section, added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4333, § 5, amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 6, related to representatives of the state body.

11121.8. Repealed by Stats. 2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 5

The repealed section, added by

Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3684, § 7, related to advisory bodies.

11121.9. Provision of copy of article to members of state body

Each state body shall provide a copy of this article to each member of the state body upon his or her appointment to membership or assumption of office.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4334, § 6. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 714, p. 2659, § 175; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 7.1.)

11121.95. Appointees or elected officials not yet in office; conformity of conduct to article requirements

Any person appointed or elected to serve as a member of a state body who has not yet assumed the duties of office shall conform his or her conduct to the requirements of this article and shall be treated for purposes of this article as if he or she has already assumed office.

(Added by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 1.)

11122. Action taken

As used in this article "action taken" means a collective decision made by the members of a state body, a collective commitment or promise by the members of the state body to make a positive or negative decision or an actual vote by the members of a state body when sitting as a body or entity

upon a motion, proposal, resolution, order or similar action.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 7.3.)

11122.5. Meeting defined; series of communications to discuss, deliberate, or take action prohibited; exceptions

- (a) As used in this article, "meeting" includes any congregation of a majority of the members of a state body at the same time and place to hear, discuss, or deliberate upon any item that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state body to which it pertains.
- (b)(1) A majority of the members of a state body shall not, outside of a meeting authorized by this chapter, use a series of communications of any kind, directly or through intermediaries, to discuss, deliberate, or take action on any item of business that is within the subject matter of the state body.
- (2) Paragraph (1) shall not be construed to prevent an employee or official of a state agency from engaging in separate conversations or communications outside of a meeting authorized by this chapter with members of a legislative body in order to answer questions or provide information regarding a matter that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state agency, if that person does not communicate to members of the legislative body the comments or position of any other member or members of the legislative body.

- (c) The prohibitions of this article do not apply to any of the following:
- (1) Individual contacts or conversations between a member of a state body and any other person that do not violate subdivision (b).
- (2)(A) The attendance of a majority of the members of a state body at a conference or similar gathering open to the public that involves a discussion of issues of general interest to the public or to public agencies of the type represented by the state body, if a majority of the members do not discuss among themselves, other than as part of the scheduled program, business of a specified nature that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state body.
- (B) Subparagraph (A) does not allow members of the public free admission to a conference or similar gathering at which the organizers have required other participants or registrants to pay fees or charges as a condition of attendance.
- (3) The attendance of a majority of the members of a state body at an open and publicized meeting organized to address a topic of state concern by a person or organization other than the state body, if a majority of the members do not discuss among themselves, other than as part of the scheduled program, business of a specific nature that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state body.
- (4) The attendance of a majority of the members of a state body at an open and

- noticed meeting of another state body or of a legislative body of a local agency as defined by Section 54951, if a majority of the members do not discuss among themselves, other than as part of the scheduled meeting, business of a specific nature that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the other state body.
- (5) The attendance of a majority of the members of a state body at a purely social or ceremonial occasion, if a majority of the members do not discuss among themselves business of a specific nature that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the state body.
- (6) The attendance of a majority of the members of a state body at an open and noticed meeting of a standing committee of that body, if the members of the state body who are not members of the standing committee attend only as observers.

(Added by Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 6. Amended by Stats.2009, c. 150 (A.B.1494), § 1.)

11123. Meetings; attendance; teleconference option

- (a) All meetings of a state body shall be open and public and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of a state body except as otherwise provided in this article.
- (b)(1) This article does not prohibit a state body from holding an open or closed meeting by teleconference for the benefit of the public and state body. The meeting or proceeding held by teleconference shall

otherwise comply with all applicable requirements or laws relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding, including the following:

- (A) The teleconferencing meeting shall comply with all requirements of this article applicable to other meetings.
- (B) The portion of the teleconferenced meeting that is required to be open to the public shall be audible to the public at the location specified in the notice of the meeting.
- (C) If the state body elects to conduct a meeting or proceeding by teleconference, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations and conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the rights of any party or member of the public appearing before the state body. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. The agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the state body directly pursuant to Section 11125.7 at each teleconference location.
- (D) All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- (E) The portion of the teleconferenced meeting that is closed to the public may not include the consideration of any agenda item being heard pursuant to Section 11125.5.
 - (F) At least one member of the state

body shall be physically present at the location specified in the notice of the meeting.

- (2) For the purposes of this subdivision, "teleconference" means a meeting of a state body, the members of which are at different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or both audio and video. This section does not prohibit a state body from providing members of the public with additional locations in which the public may observe or address the state body by electronic means, through either audio or both audio and video.
- (c) The state body shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 7.5; Stats.1994, c. 1153 (A.B.3467), § 1; Stats.1997, c. 52 (A.B.1097), § 1; Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 7; Stats.2014, c. 510 (A.B.2720), § 1, eff. Jan. 1, 2015.)

11123.1. State body meetings to meet protections and prohibitions of the Americans with Disabilities Act

All meetings of a state body that are open and public shall meet the protections and prohibitions contained in Section 202 of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and the federal rules and regulations adopted in implementation thereof.

(Added by Stats. 2002, c. 300 (A.B. 3035), § 1.)

11124. Conditions to attendance

No person shall be required, as a condition to attendance at a meeting of a state body, to register his or her name, to provide other information, to complete a questionnaire, or otherwise to fulfill any condition precedent to his or her attendance.

If an attendance list, register, questionnaire, or other similar document is posted at or near the entrance to the room where the meeting is to be held, or is circulated to persons present during the meeting, it shall state clearly that the signing, registering, or completion of the document is voluntary, and that all persons may attend the meeting regardless of whether a person signs, registers, or completes the document.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 8.)

11124.1. Audio or video recording of proceedings; inspection of state's recording; broadcast restrictions

(a) Any person attending an open and public meeting of the state body shall have the right to record the proceedings with an audio or video recorder or a still or motion picture camera in the absence of a reasonable finding by the state body that the recording cannot continue without noise, illumination, or obstruction of view that constitutes, or would constitute, a persistent disruption of the proceedings.

- (b) Any audio or video recording of an open and public meeting made for whatever purpose by or at the direction of the state body shall be subject to inspection pursuant to the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1), but may be erased or destroyed 30 days after the recording. Any inspection of an audio or video recording shall be provided without charge on equipment made available by the state body.
- (c) No state body shall prohibit or otherwise restrict the broadcast of its open and public meetings in the absence of a reasonable finding that the broadcast cannot be accomplished without noise, illumination, or obstruction of view that would constitute a persistent disruption of the proceedings.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4334, § 7. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 9; Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 2; Stats.2009, c. 88 (A.B.176), § 42.)

11125. Notice of meeting

(a) The state body shall provide notice of its meeting to any person who requests that notice in writing. Notice shall be given and also made available on the Internet at least 10 days in advance of the meeting, and shall include the name, address, and telephone number of any person who can provide further information prior to the meeting, but need not include a list of witnesses expected to appear at the meeting. The written notice shall additionally include the address of the

Internet site where notices required by this article are made available.

- (b) The notice of a meeting of a body that is a state body shall include a specific agenda for the meeting, containing a brief description of the items of business to be transacted or discussed in either open or closed session. A brief general description of an item generally need not exceed 20 words. A description of an item to be transacted or discussed in closed session shall include a citation of the specific statutory authority under which a closed session is being held. No item shall be added to the agenda subsequent to the provision of this notice, unless otherwise permitted by this article.
- (c) Notice of a meeting of a state body that complies with this section shall also constitute notice of a meeting of an advisory body of that state body, provided that the business to be discussed by the advisory body is covered by the notice of the meeting of the state body, provided that the specific time and place of the advisory body's meeting is announced during the open and public state body's meeting, and provided that the advisory body's meeting is conducted within a reasonable time of, and nearby, the meeting of the state body.
- (d) A person may request, and shall be provided, notice pursuant to subdivision (a) for all meetings of a state body or for a specific meeting or meetings. In addition, at the state body's discretion, a person may request, and may be provided, notice of only those meetings of a state body at which a particular subject or subjects specified in the request will be discussed.

- (e) A request for notice of more than one meeting of a state body shall be subject to the provisions of Section 14911.
- (f) The notice shall be made available in appropriate alternative formats, as required by Section 202 of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and the federal rules and regulations adopted in implementation thereof, upon request, by any person with a disability. The notice shall include information regarding how, to whom, and by when a request for any disability-related modification or accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services may be made by a person with a disability who requires these aids or services in order to participate in the public meeting.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1973, c. 1126, p. 2291, § 1; Stats.1975, c. 708, p. 1695, § 1; Stats.1979, c. 284, § 1, eff. July 24, 1979; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3685, § 10. Amended by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 3; Stats.1999, c. 393 (A.B.1234), § 1; Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 8; Stats. 2002, c. 300 (A.B. 3035), § 2.)

- 11125.1. Agendas and other writings distributed for discussion or consideration at public meetings; public records; Franchise Tax Board; inspection; availability on the Internet; closed sessions
- (a) Notwithstanding Section 6255 or any other provisions of law, agendas of public meetings and other writings, when distributed to all, or a majority of all, of the members of a state body by any person in connection with a matter subject to

discussion or consideration at a public meeting of the body, are disclosable public records under the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1), and shall be made available upon request without delay. However, this section shall not include any writing exempt from public disclosure under Section 6253.5, 6254, or 6254.7 of this code, or Section 489.1 or 583 of the Public Utilities Code.

- (b) Writings that are public records under subdivision (a) and that are distributed to members of the state body prior to or during a meeting, pertaining to any item to be considered during the meeting, shall be made available for public inspection at the meeting if prepared by the state body or a member of the state body, or after the meeting if prepared by some other person. These writings shall be made available in appropriate alternative formats, as required by Section 202 of the American with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and the federal rules and regulations adopted in implementation thereof, upon request by a person with a disability.
- (c) In the case of the Franchise Tax Board, prior to that state body taking final action on any item, writings pertaining to that item that are public records under subdivision (a) that are prepared and distributed by the Franchise Tax Board staff or individual members to members of the state body prior to or during a meeting shall be:
- (1) Made available for public inspection at that meeting.

- (2) Distributed to all persons who request notice in writing pursuant to subdivision (a) of Section 11125.
 - (3) Made available on the Internet.
- (d) Prior to the State Board of Equalization taking final action on any item that does not involve a named tax or fee payer, writings pertaining to that item that are public records under subdivision (a) that are prepared and distributed by board staff or individual members to members of the state body prior to or during a meeting shall be:
- (1) Made available for public inspection at that meeting.
- (2) Distributed to all persons who request or have requested copies of these writings.
 - (3) Made available on the Internet.
- (e) Nothing in this section shall be construed to prevent a state body from charging a fee or deposit for a copy of a public record pursuant to Section 6253, except that no surcharge shall be imposed on persons with disabilities in violation of Section 202 of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and the federal rules and regulations adopted in implementation thereof. The writings described in subdivision (b) are subject to the requirements of the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1), and shall not be construed to limit or delay the public's right

to inspect any record required to be disclosed by that act, or to limit the public's right to inspect any record covered by that act. This section shall not be construed to be applicable to any writings solely because they are properly discussed in a closed session of a state body. Nothing in this article shall be construed to require a state body to place any paid advertisement or any other paid notice in any publication.

(f) "Writing" for purposes of this section means " writing" as defined under Section 6252.

(Added by Stats.1975, c. 959, p. 2238, § 4. Amended by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4334, § 8; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3686, § 10.1. Amended by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 4; Stats.2001, c. 670 (S.B.445), § 1; Stats. 2002, c. 300 (A.B. 3035), § 3.5.); Stats. 2005, c. 188 (A.B. 780), § 1.)

11125.2. Appointment, employment or dismissal of public employees; closed sessions; public report

Any state body shall report publicly at a subsequent public meeting any action taken, and any rollcall vote thereon, to appoint, employ, or dismiss a public employee arising out of any closed session of the state body.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4335, § 9. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3687, § 10.3.)

11125.3. Action on items of business not appearing on agenda; notice

(a) Notwithstanding Section 11125, a

state body may take action on items of business not appearing on the posted agenda under any of the conditions stated below:

- (1) Upon a determination by a majority vote of the state body that an emergency situation exists, as defined in Section 11125.5.
- (2) Upon a determination by a two-thirds vote of the state body, or, if less than two-thirds of the members are present, a unanimous vote of those members present, that there exists a need to take immediate action and that the need for action came to the attention of the state body subsequent to the agenda being posted as specified in Section 11125.
- (b) Notice of the additional item to be considered shall be provided to each member of the state body and to all parties that have requested notice of its meetings as soon as is practicable after a determination of the need to consider the item is made, but shall be delivered in a manner that allows it to be received by the members and by newspapers of general circulation and radio or television stations at least 48 hours before the time of the meeting specified in the notice. Notice shall be made available to newspapers of general circulation and radio or television stations by providing that notice to all national press wire services. Notice shall also be made available on the Internet as soon as is practicable after the decision to consider additional items at a meeting has been made.

(Added by Stats.1994, c. 1153 (A.B.3467), § 2. Amended by Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 9.)

11125.4. Special meetings; authorized purposes; notice; required finding of hardship or need to protect public interest

- (a) A special meeting may be called at any time by the presiding officer of the state body or by a majority of the members of the state body. A special meeting may only be called for one of the following purposes when compliance with the 10-day notice provisions of Section 11125 would impose a substantial hardship on the state body or where immediate action is required to protect the public interest:
- (1) To consider "pending litigation" as that term is defined in subdivision (e) of Section 11126.
 - (2) To consider proposed legislation.
- (3) To consider issuance of a legal opinion.
- (4) To consider disciplinary action involving a state officer or employee.
- (5) To consider the purchase, sale, exchange, or lease of real property.
- (6) To consider license examinations and applications.
- (7) To consider an action on a loan or grant provided pursuant to Division 31 (commencing with Section 50000) of the Health and Safety Code.
- (8) To consider its response to a confidential final draft audit report as permitted by Section 11126.2.

- (9) To provide for an interim executive officer of a state body upon the death, incapacity, or vacancy in the office of the executive officer.
- (b) When a special meeting is called pursuant to one of the purposes specified in subdivision (a), the state body shall provide notice of the special meeting to each member of the state body and to all parties that have requested notice of its meetings as soon as is practicable after the decision to call a special meeting has been made, but shall deliver the notice in a manner that allows it to be received by the members and by newspapers of general circulation and radio or television stations at least 48 hours before the time of the special meeting specified in the notice. Notice shall be made available to newspapers of general circulation and radio or television stations by providing that notice to all national press wire services. Notice shall also be made available on the Internet within the time periods required by this section. The notice shall specify the time and place of the special meeting and the business to be transacted. The written notice shall additionally specify the address of the Internet Web site where notices required by this article are made available. No other business shall be considered at a special meeting by the state body. The written notice may be dispensed with as to any member who at or prior to the time the meeting convenes files with the clerk or secretary of the state body a written waiver of notice. The waiver may be given by telegram, facsimile transmission, or similar means. The written notice may also be

dispensed with as to any member who is actually present at the meeting at the time it convenes. Notice shall be required pursuant to this section regardless of whether any action is taken at the special meeting.

(c) At the commencement of any special meeting, the state body must make a finding in open session that the delay necessitated by providing notice 10 days prior to a meeting as required by Section 11125 would cause a substantial hardship on the body or that immediate action is required to protect the public interest. The finding shall set forth the specific facts that constitute the hardship to the body or the impending harm to the public interest. The finding shall be adopted by a two-thirds vote of the body, or, if less than two-thirds of the members are present, a unanimous vote of those members present. The finding shall be made available on the Internet. Failure to adopt the finding terminates the meeting.

(Added by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 5. Amended by Stats.1999, c. 393 (A.B.1234), § 2; Stats.2004, c. 576 (A.B.1827), § 1.); Stats. 2007, c. 92 (S.B. 519), § 1.)

11125.5. Emergency meetings

(a) In the case of an emergency situation involving matters upon which prompt action is necessary due to the disruption or threatened disruption of public facilities, a state body may hold an emergency meeting without complying with the 10-day notice requirement of Section 11125 or the 48-hour notice requirement of Section 11125.4.

- (b) For purposes of this section, "emergency situation" means any of the following, as determined by a majority of the members of the state body during a meeting prior to the emergency meeting, or at the beginning of the emergency meeting:
- (1) Work stoppage or other activity that severely impairs public health or safety, or both.
- (2) Crippling disaster that severely impairs public health or safety, or both.
- (c) However, newspapers of general circulation and radio or television stations that have requested notice of meetings pursuant to Section 11125 shall be notified by the presiding officer of the state body, or a designee thereof, one hour prior to the emergency meeting by telephone. Notice shall also be made available on the Internet as soon as is practicable after the decision to call the emergency meeting has been made. If telephone services are not functioning, the notice requirements of this section shall be deemed waived, and the presiding officer of the state body, or a designee thereof, shall notify those newspapers, radio stations, or television stations of the fact of the holding of the emergency meeting, the purpose of the meeting, and any action taken at the meeting as soon after the meeting as possible.
- (d) The minutes of a meeting called pursuant to this section, a list of persons who the presiding officer of the state body, or a designee thereof, notified or attempted to notify, a copy of the rollcall vote, and any action taken at the meeting

shall be posted for a minimum of 10 days in a public place, and also made available on the Internet for a minimum of 10 days, as soon after the meeting as possible.

(Amended by Stats.1992, c. 1312 (A.B.2912), § 11, eff. Sept. 30, 1992; Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 6; Stats.1999, c. 393 (A.B.1234), § 3.)

11125.6. Fish and Game Commission; emergency meetings; appeals of fishery closures or restrictions

- (a) An emergency meeting may be called at any time by the president of the Fish and Game Commission or by a majority of the members of the commission to consider an appeal of a closure of or restriction in a fishery adopted pursuant to Section 7710 of the Fish and Game Code. In the case of an emergency situation involving matters upon which prompt action is necessary due to the disruption or threatened disruption of an established fishery, the commission may hold an emergency meeting without complying with the 10-day notice requirement of Section 11125 or the 48-hour notice requirement of Section 11125.4 if the delay necessitated by providing the 10-day notice of a public meeting required by Section 11125 or the 48-hour notice required by Section 11125.4 would significantly adversely impact the economic benefits of a fishery to the participants in the fishery and to the people of the state or significantly adversely impact the sustainability of a fishery managed by the state.
- (b) At the commencement of an emergency meeting called pursuant to this section, the commission shall make a

finding in open session that the delay necessitated by providing notice 10 days prior to a meeting as required by Section 11125 or 48 hours prior to a meeting as required by Section 11125.4 would significantly adversely impact the economic benefits of a fishery to the participants in the fishery and to the people of the state or significantly adversely impact the sustainability of a fishery managed by the state. The finding shall set forth the specific facts that constitute the impact to the economic benefits of the fishery or the sustainability of the fishery. The finding shall be adopted by a vote of at least four members of the commission, or, if less than four of the members are present, a unanimous vote of those members present. Failure to adopt the finding shall terminate the meeting.

- (c) Newspapers of general circulation and radio or television stations that have requested notice of meetings pursuant to Section 11125 shall be notified by the presiding officer of the commission, or a designee thereof, one hour prior to the emergency meeting by telephone.
- (d) The minutes of an emergency meeting called pursuant to this section, a list of persons who the president of the commission, or a designee thereof, notified or attempted to notify, a copy of the rollcall vote, and any action taken at the meeting shall be posted for a minimum of 10 days in a public place as soon after the meeting as possible.

(Added by Stats.1998, c. 1052 (A.B.1241), S 21.)

11125.7. Agenda item discussion before state body; opportunity for public address; regulation by state body; freedom of expression; application of provisions

- (a) Except as otherwise provided in this section, the state body shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to directly address the state body on each agenda item before or during the state body's discussion or consideration of the item. This section is not applicable if the agenda item has already been considered by a committee composed exclusively of members of the state body at a public meeting where interested members of the public were afforded the opportunity to address the committee on the item, before or during the committee's consideration of the item, unless the item has been substantially changed since the committee heard the item, as determined by the state body. Every notice for a special meeting at which action is proposed to be taken on an item shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to directly address the state body concerning that item prior to action on the item. In addition, the notice requirement of Section 11125 shall not preclude the acceptance of testimony at meetings, other than emergency meetings, from members of the public if no action is taken by the state body at the same meeting on matters brought before the body by members of the public.
- (b) The state body may adopt reasonable regulations to ensure that the intent of subdivision (a) is carried out, including, but not limited to, regulations

limiting the total amount of time allocated for public comment on particular issues and for each individual speaker.

- (c)(1) Notwithstanding subdivision
 (b), when a state body limits time for public comment the state body shall provide at least twice the allotted time to a member of the public who utilizes a translator to ensure that non-English speakers receive the same opportunity to directly address the state body.
- (2) Paragraph (1) shall not apply if the state body utilizes simultaneous translation equipment in a manner that allows the state body to hear the translated public testimony simultaneously.
- (d) The state body shall not prohibit public criticism of the policies, programs, or services of the state body, or of the acts or omissions of the state body. Nothing in this subdivision shall confer any privilege or protection for expression beyond that otherwise provided by law.
- (e) This section is not applicable to closed sessions held pursuant to Section 11126.
- (f) This section is not applicable to decisions regarding proceedings held pursuant to Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 11500), relating to administrative adjudication, or to the conduct of those proceedings.
- (g) This section is not applicable to hearings conducted by the California Victim Compensation and Government Claims

Board pursuant to Sections 13963 and 13963.1.

(h) This section is not applicable to agenda items that involve decisions of the Public Utilities Commission regarding adjudicatory hearings held pursuant to Chapter 9 (commencing with Section 1701) of Part 1 of Division 1 of the Public Utilities Code. For all other agenda items, the commission shall provide members of the public, other than those who have already participated in the proceedings underlying the agenda item, an opportunity to directly address the commission before or during the commission's consideration of the item.

(Added by Stats.1993, c. 1289 (S.B.367), § 2. Amended by Stats.1995, c. 938 (S.B.523), § 13, operative July 1, 1997; Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 7; Stats.2006, c. 538 (S.B.1852), § 248; Stats.2012, c. 551 (S.B.965), § 1.; Stats. 2016, c. 31 (S.B. 836), § 71, eff. June 27, 2016.)

11125.8. Hearings to consider crimes against minors or crimes of sexual assault or domestic violence; identification of applicant; disclosure of nature of hearing

(a) Notwithstanding Section 11131.5, in any hearing that the State California Victim Compensation and Government Claims Board conducts pursuant to Section 13963.1 and that the applicant or applicant's representative does not request be open to the public, no notice, agenda, announcement, or report required under this article need identify the applicant.

(b) In any hearing that the board conducts pursuant to Section 13963.1 and that the applicant or applicant's representative does not request be open to the public, the board shall disclose that the hearing is being held pursuant to Section 13963.1. That disclosure shall be deemed to satisfy the requirements of subdivision (a) of Section 11126.3.

(Added by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 9.; Amended by Stats. 2006, c. 538 (S.B. 1852, § 249; Stats. 2016, c. 31 (S.B. 836), § 72, eff. June 27, 2016.)

11125.9. Regional water quality control boards; compliance with notification guidelines

Regional water quality control boards shall comply with the notification guidelines in Section 11125 and, in addition, shall do both of the following:

(a) Notify, in writing, all clerks of the city councils and county boards of supervisors within the regional board's jurisdiction of any and all board hearings at least 10 days prior to the hearing. Notification shall include an agenda for the meeting with contents as described in subdivision (b) of Section 11125 as well as the name, address, and telephone number of any person who can provide further information prior to the meeting, but need not include a list of witnesses expected to appear at the meeting. Each clerk, upon receipt of the notification of a board hearing, shall distribute the notice to all members of the respective city council or board of

supervisors within the regional board's jurisdiction.

(b) Notify, in writing, all newspapers with a circulation rate of at least 10,000 within the regional board's jurisdiction of any and all board hearings, at least 10 days prior to the hearing. Notification shall include an agenda for the meeting with contents as described in subdivision (b) of Section 11125 as well as the name, address, and telephone number of any person who can provide further information prior to the meeting, but need not include a list of witnesses expected to appear at the meeting.

(Added by Stats.1997, c. 301 (A.B.116), § 1.)

§ 11126. Closed sessions.

- (a)(1) Nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent a state body from holding closed sessions during a regular or special meeting to consider the appointment, employment, evaluation of performance, or dismissal of a public employee or to hear complaints or charges brought against that employee by another person or employee unless the employee requests a public hearing.
- (2) As a condition to holding a closed session on the complaints or charges to consider disciplinary action or to consider dismissal, the employee shall be given written notice of his or her right to have a public hearing, rather than a closed session, and that notice shall be delivered to the employee personally or by mail at least 24 hours before the time for holding a regular or special meeting. If notice is not given, any

disciplinary or other action taken against any employee at the closed session shall be null and void.

- (3) The state body also may exclude from any public or closed session, during the examination of a witness, any or all other witnesses in the matter being investigated by the state body.
- (4) Following the public hearing or closed session, the body may deliberate on the decision to be reached in a closed session.
- (b) For the purposes of this section, "employee" does not include any person who is elected to, or appointed to a public office by, any state body. However, officers of the California State University who receive compensation for their services, other than per diem and ordinary and necessary expenses, shall, when engaged in that capacity, be considered employees. Furthermore, for purposes of this section, the term employee includes a person exempt from civil service pursuant to subdivision (e) of Section 4 of Article VII of the California Constitution.
- (c) Nothing in this article shall be construed to do any of the following:
- (1) Prevent state bodies that administer the licensing of persons engaging in businesses or professions from holding closed sessions to prepare, approve, grade, or administer examinations.
- (2) Prevent an advisory body of a state body that administers the licensing of

persons engaged in businesses or professions from conducting a closed session to discuss matters that the advisory body has found would constitute an unwarranted invasion of the privacy of an individual licensee or applicant if discussed in an open meeting, provided the advisory body does not include a quorum of the members of the state body it advises. Those matters may include review of an applicant's qualifications for licensure and an inquiry specifically related to the state body's enforcement program concerning an individual licensee or applicant where the inquiry occurs prior to the filing of a civil, criminal, or administrative disciplinary action against the licensee or applicant by the state body.

- (3) Prohibit a state body from holding a closed session to deliberate on a decision to be reached in a proceeding required to be conducted pursuant to Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 11500) or similar provisions of law.
- (4) Grant a right to enter any correctional institution or the grounds of a correctional institution where that right is not otherwise granted by law, nor shall anything in this article be construed to prevent a state body from holding a closed session when considering and acting upon the determination of a term, parole, or release of any individual or other disposition of an individual case, or if public disclosure of the subjects under discussion or consideration is expressly prohibited by statute.
- (5) Prevent any closed session to consider the conferring of honorary degrees,

or gifts, donations, and bequests that the donor or proposed donor has requested in writing to be kept confidential.

- (6) Prevent the Alcoholic Beverage Control Appeals Board from holding a closed session for the purpose of holding a deliberative conference as provided in Section 11125.
- (7)(A) Prevent a state body from holding closed sessions with its negotiator prior to the purchase, sale, exchange, or lease of real property by or for the state body to give instructions to its negotiator regarding the price and terms of payment for the purchase, sale, exchange, or lease.
- (B) However, prior to the closed session, the state body shall hold an open and public session in which it identifies the real property or real properties that the negotiations may concern and the person or persons with whom its negotiator may negotiate.
- (C) For purposes of this paragraph, the negotiator may be a member of the state body.
- (D) For purposes of this paragraph, "lease" includes renewal or renegotiation of a lease.
- (E) Nothing in this paragraph shall preclude a state body from holding a closed session for discussions regarding eminent domain proceedings pursuant to subdivision (e).
 - (8) Prevent the California

Postsecondary Education Commission from holding closed sessions to consider matters pertaining to the appointment or termination of the Director of the California Postsecondary Education Commission.

- (9) Prevent the Council for Private Postsecondary and Vocational Education from holding closed sessions to consider matters pertaining to the appointment or termination of the Executive Director of the Council for Private Postsecondary and Vocational Education.
- (10) Prevent the Franchise Tax
 Board from holding closed sessions for the
 purpose of discussion of confidential tax
 returns or information the public disclosure
 of which is prohibited by law, or from
 considering matters pertaining to the
 appointment or removal of the Executive
 Officer of the Franchise Tax Board.
- (11) Require the Franchise Tax
 Board to notice or disclose any confidential
 tax information considered in closed
 sessions, or documents executed in
 connection therewith, the public disclosure
 of which is prohibited pursuant to Article 2
 (commencing with Section 19542) of
 Chapter 7 of Part 10.2 of Division 2 of the
 Revenue and Taxation Code.
- (12) Prevent the Corrections Standards Authority from holding closed sessions when considering reports of crime conditions under Section 6027 of the Penal Code.
- (13) Prevent the State Air Resources Board from holding closed sessions when considering the proprietary specifications

and performance data of manufacturers.

- (14) Prevent the State Board of Education or the Superintendent of Public Instruction, or any committee advising the board or the Superintendent, from holding closed sessions on those portions of its review of assessment instruments pursuant to Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 60600) of, or pursuant to Chapter 9 (commencing with Section 60850) of, Part 33 of Division 4 of Title 2 of the Education Code during which actual test content is reviewed and discussed. The purpose of this provision is to maintain the confidentiality of the assessments under review.
- (15) Prevent the <u>Department of</u>
 <u>Resources Recycling and Recovery</u> or its auxiliary committees from holding closed sessions for the purpose of discussing confidential tax returns, discussing trade secrets or confidential or proprietary information in its possession, or discussing other data, the public disclosure of which is prohibited by law.
- (16) Prevent a state body that invests retirement, pension, or endowment funds from holding closed sessions when considering investment decisions. For purposes of consideration of shareholder voting on corporate stocks held by the state body, closed sessions for the purposes of voting may be held only with respect to election of corporate directors, election of independent auditors, and other financial issues that could have a material effect on the net income of the corporation. For the purpose of real property investment decisions that may be considered in a closed

session pursuant to this paragraph, a state body shall also be exempt from the provisions of paragraph (7) relating to the identification of real properties prior to the closed session.

- (17) Prevent a state body, or boards, commissions, administrative officers, or other representatives that may properly be designated by law or by a state body, from holding closed sessions with its representatives in discharging its responsibilities under Chapter 10 (commencing with Section 3500), Chapter 10.3 (commencing with Section 3512), Chapter 10.5 (commencing with Section 3525), or Chapter 10.7 (commencing with Section 3540) of Division 4 of Title 1 as the sessions relate to salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits. For the purposes enumerated in the preceding sentence, a state body may also meet with a state conciliator who has intervened in the proceedings.
- (18)(A) Prevent a state body from holding closed sessions to consider matters posing a threat or potential threat of criminal or terrorist activity against the personnel, property, buildings, facilities, or equipment, including electronic data, owned, leased, or controlled by the state body, where disclosure of these considerations could compromise or impede the safety or security of the personnel, property, buildings, facilities, or equipment, including electronic data, owned, leased, or controlled by the state body.
- (B) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, a state body, at any regular

- or special meeting, may meet in a closed session pursuant to subparagraph (A) upon a two-thirds vote of the members present at the meeting.
- (C) After meeting in closed session pursuant to subparagraph (A), the state body shall reconvene in open session prior to adjournment and report that a closed session was held pursuant to subparagraph (A), the general nature of the matters considered, and whether any action was taken in closed session.
- (D) After meeting in closed session pursuant to subparagraph (A), the state body shall submit to the Legislative Analyst written notification stating that it held this closed session, the general reason or reasons for the closed session, the general nature of the matters considered, and whether any action was taken in closed session. The Legislative Analyst shall retain for no less than four years any written notification received from a state body pursuant to this subparagraph.
- (19) Prevent the California Sex Offender Management Board from holding a closed session for the purpose of discussing matters pertaining to the application of a sex offender treatment provider for certification pursuant to Sections 290.09 and 9003 of the Penal Code. Those matters may include review of an applicant's qualifications for certification.
- (d)(1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, any meeting of the Public Utilities Commission at which the rates of entities under the commission's jurisdiction are changed shall be open and public.

- (2) Nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent the Public Utilities Commission from holding closed sessions to deliberate on the institution of proceedings, or disciplinary actions against any person or entity under the jurisdiction of the commission.
- (e)(1) Nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent a state body, based on the advice of its legal counsel, from holding a closed session to confer with, or receive advice from, its legal counsel regarding pending litigation when discussion in open session concerning those matters would prejudice the position of the state body in the litigation.
- (2) For purposes of this article, all expressions of the lawyer-client privilege other than those provided in this subdivision are hereby abrogated. This subdivision is the exclusive expression of the lawyer-client privilege for purposes of conducting closed session meetings pursuant to this article. For purposes of this subdivision, litigation shall be considered pending when any of the following circumstances exist:
- (A) An adjudicatory proceeding before a court, an administrative body exercising its adjudicatory authority, a hearing officer, or an arbitrator, to which the state body is a party, has been initiated formally.
- (B)(i) A point has been reached where, in the opinion of the state body on the advice of its legal counsel, based on existing facts and circumstances, there is a

significant exposure to litigation against the state body.

- (ii) Based on existing facts and circumstances, the state body is meeting only to decide whether a closed session is authorized pursuant to clause (i).
- (C)(i) Based on existing facts and circumstances, the state body has decided to initiate or is deciding whether to initiate litigation.
- (ii) The legal counsel of the state body shall prepare and submit to it a memorandum stating the specific reasons and legal authority for the closed session. If the closed session is pursuant to paragraph (1), the memorandum shall include the title of the litigation. If the closed session is pursuant to subparagraph (A) or (B), the memorandum shall include the existing facts and circumstances on which it is based. The legal counsel shall submit the memorandum to the state body prior to the closed session, if feasible, and in any case no later than one week after the closed session. The memorandum shall be exempt from disclosure pursuant to Section 6254.25.
- (iii) For purposes of this subdivision, "litigation" includes any adjudicatory proceeding, including eminent domain, before a court, administrative body exercising its adjudicatory authority, hearing officer, or arbitrator.
- (iv) Disclosure of a memorandum required under this subdivision shall not be deemed as a waiver of the lawyer-client privilege, as provided for under Article 3

(commencing with Section 950) of Chapter 4 of Division 8 of the Evidence Code.

- (f) In addition to subdivisions (a), (b), and (c), nothing in this article shall be construed to do any of the following:
- (1) Prevent a state body operating under a joint powers agreement for insurance pooling from holding a closed session to discuss a claim for the payment of tort liability or public liability losses incurred by the state body or any member agency under the joint powers agreement.
- (2) Prevent the examining committee established by the State Board of Forestry and Fire Protection, pursuant to Section 763 of the Public Resources Code, from conducting a closed session to consider disciplinary action against an individual professional forester prior to the filing of an accusation against the forester pursuant to Section 11503.
- (3) Prevent the enforcement advisory committee established by the California Board of Accountancy pursuant to Section 5020 of the Business and Professions Code from conducting a closed session to consider disciplinary action against an individual accountant prior to the filing of an accusation against the accountant pursuant to Section 11503. Nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent the qualifications examining committee established by the California Board of Accountancy pursuant to Section 5023 of the Business and Professions Code from conducting a closed hearing to interview an individual applicant or accountant regarding

the applicant's qualifications.

- (4) Prevent a state body, as defined in subdivision (b) of Section 11121, from conducting a closed session to consider any matter that properly could be considered in closed session by the state body whose authority it exercises.
- (5) Prevent a state body, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 11121, from conducting a closed session to consider any matter that properly could be considered in a closed session by the body defined as a state body pursuant to subdivision (a) or (b) of Section 11121.
- (6) Prevent a state body, as defined in subdivision (c) of Section 11121, from conducting a closed session to consider any matter that properly could be considered in a closed session by the state body it advises.
- (7) Prevent the State Board of Equalization from holding closed sessions for either of the following:
- (A) When considering matters pertaining to the appointment or removal of the Executive Secretary of the State Board of Equalization.
- (B) For the purpose of hearing confidential taxpayer appeals or data, the public disclosure of which is prohibited by law.
- (8) Require the State Board of Equalization to disclose any action taken in closed session or documents executed in connection with that action, the public

disclosure of which is prohibited by law pursuant to Sections 15619 and 15641 of this code and Sections 833, 7056, 8255, 9255, 11655, 30455, 32455, 38705, 38706, 43651, 45982, 46751, 50159, 55381, and 60609 of the Revenue and Taxation Code.

- (9) Prevent the California
 Earthquake Prediction Evaluation Council,
 or other body appointed to advise the
 <u>Director</u> of Emergency <u>Services</u> or the
 Governor concerning matters relating to
 volcanic or earthquake predictions, from
 holding closed sessions when considering
 the evaluation of possible predictions.
- (g) This article does not prevent either of the following:
- (1) The Teachers' Retirement Board or the Board of Administration of the Public Employees' Retirement System from holding closed sessions when considering matters pertaining to the recruitment, appointment, employment, or removal of the chief executive officer or when considering matters pertaining to the recruitment or removal of the Chief Investment Officer of the State Teachers' Retirement System or the Public Employees' Retirement System.
- (2) The Commission on Teacher Credentialing from holding closed sessions when considering matters relating to the recruitment, appointment, or removal of its executive director.
- (h) This article does not prevent the Board of Administration of the Public Employees' Retirement System from holding closed sessions when considering matters

relating to the development of rates and competitive strategy for plans offered pursuant to Chapter 15 (commencing with Section 21660) of Part 3 of Division 5 of Title 2.

- (i) This article does not prevent the Managed Risk Medical Insurance Board from holding closed sessions when considering matters related to the development of rates and contracting strategy for entities contracting or seeking to contract with the board, entities with which the board is considering a contract, or entities with which the board is considering or enters into any other arrangement under which the board provides, receives, or arranges services or reimbursement, pursuant to Part 6.2 (commencing with Section 12693), Part 6.3 (commencing with Section 12695), Part 6.4 (commencing with Section 12699.50), Part 6.5 (commencing with Section 12700), Part 6.6 (commencing with Section 12739.5), or Part 6.7 (commencing with Section 12739.70) of Division 2 of the Insurance Code.
- (j) Nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent the board of the State Compensation Insurance Fund from holding closed sessions in the following:
- (1) When considering matters related to claims pursuant to Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 3200) of Division 4 of the Labor Code, to the extent that confidential medical information or other individually identifiable information would be disclosed.
 - (2) To the extent that matters related

to audits and investigations that have not been completed would be disclosed.

- (3) To the extent that an internal audit containing proprietary information would be disclosed.
- (4) To the extent that the session would address the development of rates, contracting strategy, underwriting, or competitive strategy, pursuant to the powers granted to the board in Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 11770) of Part 3 of Division 2 of the Insurance Code, when discussion in open session concerning those matters would prejudice the position of the State Compensation Insurance Fund.
- (k) The State Compensation
 Insurance Fund shall comply with the procedures specified in Section 11125.4 of the Government Code with respect to any closed session or meeting authorized by subdivision (j), and in addition shall provide an opportunity for a member of the public to be heard on the issue of the appropriateness of closing the meeting or session.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1968, c. 1272, p. 2396, § 1; Stats.1970, c. 346, p. 741, § 5; Stats.1972, c. 431, p. 791, § 43; Stats.1972, c. 1010, p. 1872, § 63, eff. Aug. 17, 1972, operative July 1, 1972; Stats.1974, c. 1254, p. 2713, § 1; Stats.1974, c. 1539, p. 3525, § 1; Stats.1975, c. 197, p. 570, § 1; Stats.1975, c. 959, p. 2238, § 5; Stats.1977, c. 730, p. 2318, § 5, eff. Sept. 12, 1977; Stats.1980, c. 1197, p. 4043, § 1; Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4338, § 11; Stats.1981, c. 180, p. 1096, § 1; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3688, § 12; Stats.1982, c. 454, p. 1842, § 40; Stats.1983, c. 143, § 187; Stats.1984, c. 678, § 1; Stats.1984, c. 1284, § 4; Stats.1985, c. 186, § 1; Stats.1985, c. 1091, § 1; Stats.1986, c. 575, § 1; Stats.1987, c. 1320, § 2;

Stats.1988, c. 1448, § 29; Stats.1989, c. 177, § 2; Stats.1989, c. 882, § 2; Stats.1989, c. 1360, § 52; Stats.1989, c. 1427, § 1, eff. Oct. 2, 1989, operative Jan. 1, 1990; Stats.1991, c. 788 (A.B.1440), § 4; Stats.1992, c. 1050 (A.B.2987), § 17; Stats.1994, c. 26 (A.B.1807), § 230, eff. March 30, 1994; Stats.1994, c. 422 (A.B.2589), § 15.5, eff. Sept. 7, 1994; Stats.1994, c. 845 (S.B.1316), § 1; Stats.1995, c. 975 (A.B.265), § 3; Stats.1996, c. 1041 (A.B.3358), § 2; Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 8; Stats.1998, c. 210 (S.B.2008), § 1; Stats.1998, c. 972 (S.B.989), § 1; Stats.1999, c. 735 (S.B.366), § 9, eff. Oct. 10, 1999; Stats.2000, c. 1002 (S.B.1998), § 1; Stats.2000, c. 1055 (A.B.2889), § 30, eff. Sept. 30, 2000; Stats.2001, c. 21 (S.B.54), § 1, eff. June 25, 2001; Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 10; Stats.2002, c; 664 (A.B.3034), § 93.7; Stats.2002, c. 1113 (A.B.2072), § 1; Stats.2005, c. 288 (A.B.277), § 1; Stats.2007, c. 577 (A.B.1750), § 4, eff. Oct. 13, 2007; Stats.2008, c. 179 (S.B.1498), § 91; Stats.2008, c. 344 (S.B.1145), § 3, eff. Sept. 26, 2008; Stats.2010, c. 328 (S.B.1330), § 81; Stats.2010, c. 32 (A.B.1887), § 2, eff. June 29, 2010; Stats.2010, c. 618 (A.B.2791), § 124; Stats.2011, c. 357 (A.B.813), § 1; Stats.2013, c. 352 (A.B.1317), § 234, eff. Sept. 26, 2013, operative July 1, 2013.)

11126.1. Record of topics discussed and decisions made at closed sessions; availability

The state body shall designate a clerk or other officer or employee of the state body, who shall then attend each closed session of the state body and keep and enter in a minute book a record of topics discussed and decisions made at the meeting. The minute book made pursuant to this section is not a public record subject to inspection pursuant to the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1), and shall be kept confidential. The minute book shall be available to members of the state

body or, if a violation of this chapter is alleged to have occurred at a closed session, to a court of general jurisdiction. Such minute book may, but need not, consist of a recording of the closed session.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4340, § 12. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3691, § 13.)

11126.2. Closed session; response to confidential final draft audit report; public release of report

- (a) Nothing in this article shall be construed to prohibit a state body that has received a confidential final draft audit report from the Bureau of State Audits from holding closed sessions to discuss its response to that report.
- (b) After the public release of an audit report by the Bureau of State Audits, if a state body meets to discuss the audit report, it shall do so in an open session unless exempted from that requirement by some other provision of law.

(Added by Stats.2004, c. 576 (A.B.1827), § 2.)

11126.3. Disclosure of nature of items to be discussed in closed session; scope of session; notice of meeting; announcement of pending litigation; unnecessary disclosures; disclosures at open session following closed session

(a) Prior to holding any closed session, the state body shall disclose, in an open meeting, the general nature of the item or items to be discussed in the closed

session. The disclosure may take the form of a reference to the item or items as they are listed by number or letter on the agenda. If the session is closed pursuant to paragraph (2) of subdivision (d) of Section 11126, the state body shall state the title of, or otherwise specifically identify, the proceeding or disciplinary action contemplated. However, should the body determine that to do so would jeopardize the body's ability to effectuate service of process upon one or more unserved parties if the proceeding or disciplinary action is commenced or that to do so would fail to protect the private economic and business reputation of the person or entity if the proceeding or disciplinary action is not commenced, then the state body shall notice that there will be a closed session and describe in general terms the purpose of that session. If the session is closed pursuant to subparagraph (A) of paragraph (2) of subdivision (e) of Section 11126, the state body shall state the title of, or otherwise specifically identify, the litigation to be discussed unless the body states that to do so would jeopardize the body's ability to effectuate service of process upon one or more unserved parties, or that to do so would jeopardize its ability to conclude existing settlement negotiations to its advantage.

- (b) In the closed session, the state body may consider only those matters covered in its disclosure.
- (c) The disclosure shall be made as part of the notice provided for the meeting pursuant to Section 11125 or pursuant to subdivision (a) of Section 92032 of the

Education Code and of any order or notice required by Section 11129.

- (d) If, after the agenda has been published in compliance with this article, any pending litigation (under subdivision (e) of Section 11126) matters arise, the postponement of which will prevent the state body from complying with any statutory, court-ordered, or other legally imposed deadline, the state body may proceed to discuss those matters in closed session and shall publicly announce in the meeting the title of, or otherwise specifically identify, the litigation to be discussed, unless the body states that to do so would jeopardize the body's ability to effectuate service of process upon one or more unserved parties, or that to do so would jeopardize its ability to conclude existing settlement negotiations to its advantage. Such an announcement shall be deemed to comply fully with the requirements of this section.
- (e) Nothing in this section shall require or authorize a disclosure of names or other information that would constitute an invasion of privacy or otherwise unnecessarily divulge the particular facts concerning the closed session or the disclosure of which is prohibited by state or federal law.
- (f) After any closed session, the state body shall reconvene into open session prior to adjournment and shall make any reports, provide any documentation, and make any other disclosures required by Section 11125.2 of action taken in the closed session.
 - (g) The announcements required to

be made in open session pursuant to this section may be made at the location announced in the agenda for the closed session, as long as the public is allowed to be present at that location for the purpose of hearing the announcement.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4341, § 13. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3692, § 14; Stats.1987, c. 1320, § 3. Amended by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 10; Stats.1998, c. 210 (S.B.2008), § 2; Stats.2001, c. 243 (A.B.192), § 11.)

11126.4. Closed sessions of Gambling Control Commission; information prohibited from being disclosed by law or tribal-state gaming compact; limitations; public notice

- (a) Nothing in this article shall be construed to prevent the California Gambling Control Commission from holding a closed session when discussing matters involving trade secrets, nonpublic financial data, confidential or proprietary information, and other date and information, the public disclosure of which is prohibited by law or a tribal-state gaming compact.
- (b) Discussion in closed session authorized by this section shall be limited to the confidential data and information related to the agendized item and shall not include discussion of any other information or matter.
- (c) Before going into closed session the commission shall publicly announce the type of data or information to be discussed in closed session, which shall be recorded upon the commission minutes.

(d) Action taken on agenda items discussed pursuant to this section shall be taken in open session.

(Added by Stats. 2005, c. 274 (S.B. 919), § 1.)

11126.5. Disorderly conduct of general public during meeting; clearing of room

In the event that any meeting is willfully interrupted by a group or groups of persons so as to render the orderly conduct of such meeting unfeasible and order cannot be restored by the removal of individuals who are willfully interrupting the meeting the state body conducting the meeting may order the meeting room cleared and continue in session. Nothing in this section shall prohibit the state body from establishing a procedure for readmitting an individual or individuals not responsible for willfully disturbing the orderly conduct of the meeting. Notwithstanding any other provision of law, only matters appearing on the agenda may be considered in such a session. Representatives of the press or other news media, except those participating in the disturbance, shall be allowed to attend any session held pursuant to this section.

(Added by Stats.1970, c. 1610, p. 3385, § 1. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3692, § 15.)

11126.7. Fees

No fees may be charged by a state body for providing a notice required by Section 11125 or for carrying out any provision of this article, except as specifically authorized pursuant to this article.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4341, § 14. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3692, § 16.)

11127. Application of article

Each provision of this article shall apply to every state body unless the body is specifically excepted from that provision by law or is covered by any other conflicting provision of law.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3692, § 17.)

11128. Time of closed session

Each closed session of a state body shall be held only during a regular or special meeting of the body.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4341, § 15; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3692, § 18.)

11128.5. Adjournment; declaration; notice; hour for reconvened meeting

The state body may adjourn any regular, adjourned regular, special, or adjourned special meeting to a time and place specified in the order of adjournment. Less than a quorum may so adjourn from time to time. If all members are absent from

any regular or adjourned regular meeting, the clerk or secretary of the state body may declare the meeting adjourned to a stated time and place and he or she shall cause a written notice of the adjournment to be given in the same manner as provided in Section 11125.4 for special meetings, unless that notice is waived as provided for special meetings. A copy of the order or notice of adjournment shall be conspicuously posted on or near the door of the place where the regular, adjourned regular, special, or adjourned special meeting was held within 24 hours after the time of the adjournment. When a regular or adjourned regular meeting is adjourned as provided in this section, the resulting adjourned regular meeting is a regular meeting for all purposes. When an order of adjournment of any meeting fails to state the hour at which the adjourned meeting is to be held, it shall be held at the hour specified for regular meetings by law or regulation.

(Added by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 11.)

11129. Continuance; posting notice

Any hearing being held, or noticed or ordered to be held by a state body at any meeting may by order or notice of continuance be continued or recontinued to any subsequent meeting of the state body in the same manner and to the same extent set forth in Section 11128.5 for the adjournment of meetings. A copy of the order or notice of continuance shall be conspicuously posted on or near the door of the place where the hearing was held within 24 hours

after the time of the continuance; provided, that if the hearing is continued to a time less than 24 hours after the time specified in the order or notice of hearing, a copy of the order or notice of continuance of hearing shall be posted immediately following the meeting at which the order or declaration of continuance was adopted or made.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3692, § 19. Amended by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 12.)

11130. Actions to prevent violations or determine applicability of article; validity of rules discouraging expression; audio recording of closed sessions; discovery procedures for recordings

- (a) The Attorney General, the district attorney, or any interested person may commence an action by mandamus, injunction, or declaratory relief for the purpose of stopping or preventing violations or threatened violations of this article or to determine the applicability of this article to past actions or threatened future action by members of the state body or to determine whether any rule or action by the state body to penalize or otherwise discourage the expression of one or more of its members is valid or invalid under the laws of this state or of the United States, or to compel the state body to audio record its closed sessions as hereinafter provided.
- (b) The court in its discretion may, upon a judgment of a violation of Section 11126, order the state body to audio record its closed sessions and preserve the audio

recordings for the period and under the terms of security and confidentiality the court deems appropriate.

- (c)(1) Each recording so kept shall be immediately labeled with the date of the closed session recorded and the title of the clerk or other officer who shall be custodian of the recording.
- (2) The audio recordings shall be subject to the following discovery procedures:
- (A) In any case in which discovery or disclosure of the audio recording is sought by the Attorney General, the district attorney, or the plaintiff in a civil action pursuant to this section or Section 11130.3 alleging that a violation of this article has occurred in a closed session that has been recorded pursuant to this section, the party seeking discovery or disclosure shall file a written notice of motion with the appropriate court with notice to the governmental agency that has custody and control of the audio recording. The notice shall be given pursuant to subdivision (b) of Section 1005 of the Code of Civil Procedure.
- (B) The notice shall include, in addition to the items required by Section 1010 of the Code of Civil Procedure, all of the following:
- (i) Identification of the proceeding in which discovery or disclosure is sought, the party seeking discovery or disclosure, the date and time of the meeting recorded, and the governmental agency that has custody and control of the recording.

- (ii) An affidavit that contains specific facts indicating that a violation of the act occurred in the closed session.
- (3) If the court, following a review of the motion, finds that there is good cause to believe that a violation has occurred, the court may review, in camera, the recording of that portion of the closed session alleged to have violated the act.
- (4) If, following the in camera review, the court concludes that disclosure of a portion of the recording would be likely to materially assist in the resolution of the litigation alleging violation of this article, the court shall, in its discretion, make a certified transcript of the portion of the recording a public exhibit in the proceeding.
- (5) Nothing in this section shall permit discovery of communications that are protected by the attorney-client privilege.

(Added by Stats.1967, c. 1656, p. 4026, § 122. Amended by Stats.1969, c. 494, p. 1106, § 1; Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3693, § 20; Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 13; Stats.1999, c. 393 (A.B.1234), § 4; Stats.2009, c. 88 (A.B.176), § 43.)

11130.3. Judicial determination action by state body in violation of §§ 11123 or 11125 null and void; action by interested person; grounds

(a) Any interested person may commence an action by mandamus, injunction, or declaratory relief for the purpose of obtaining a judicial determination that an action taken by a state body in violation of Section 11123 or 11125 is null

and void under this section. Any action seeking such a judicial determination shall be commenced within 90 days from the date the action was taken. Nothing in this section shall be construed to prevent a state body from curing or correcting an action challenged pursuant to this section.

- (b) An action shall not be determined to be null and void if any of the following conditions exist:
- (1) The action taken was in connection with the sale or issuance of notes, bonds, or other evidences of indebtedness or any contract, instrument, or agreement related thereto.
- (2) The action taken gave rise to a contractual obligation upon which a party has, in good faith, detrimentally relied.
- (3) The action taken was in substantial compliance with Sections 11123 and 11125.
- (4) The action taken was in connection with the collection of any tax.

(Amended by Stats.1999, c. 393 (A.B.1234), § 5.)

11130.5. Court costs and attorney fees

A court may award court costs and reasonable attorney's fees to the plaintiff in an action brought pursuant to Section 11130 or 11130.3 where it is found that a state body has violated the provisions of this article. The costs and fees shall be paid by the state body and shall not become a

personal liability of any public officer or employee thereof.

A court may award court costs and reasonable attorney's fees to a defendant in any action brought pursuant to Section 11130 or 11130.3 where the defendant has prevailed in a final determination of the action and the court finds that the action was clearly frivolous and totally lacking in merit.

(Added by Stats.1975, c. 959, p. 2240, § 6. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3693, § 21; Stats.1985, c. 936, § 2.)

11130.7. Violations; misdemeanor

Each member of a state body who attends a meeting of that body in violation of any provision of this article, and where the member intends to deprive the public of information to which the member knows or has reason to know the public is entitled under this article, is guilty of a misdemeanor.

(Added by Stats.1980, c. 1284, p. 4341, § 16. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3693, § 22. Amended by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B. 95), § 14.)

11131. Use of facility allowing discrimination; state agency

No state agency shall conduct any meeting, conference, or other function in any facility that prohibits the admittance of any person, or persons, on the basis of ancestry, or any characteristic listed or defined in Section 11135 or that is inaccessible to disabled persons, or where members of the

public may not be present without making a payment or purchase. As used in this section, "state agency" means and includes every state body, office, officer, department, division, bureau, board, council, commission, or other state agency.

(Added by Stats.1970, c. 383, p. 798, § 1. Amended by Stats.1981, c. 968, p. 3693, § 23. Amended by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 15.; Stats. 2007, c. 568 (A.B. 14), § 32.)

11131.5. Identity of victims or alleged victims of crimes, tortious sexual conduct, or child abuse; public disclosure

No notice, agenda, announcement, or report required under this article need identify any victim or alleged victim of crime, tortious sexual conduct, or child abuse unless the identity of the person has been publicly disclosed.

(Added by Stats.1997, c. 949 (S.B.95), § 16.)

11132. Closed session by state body prohibited

Except as expressly authorized by this article, no closed session may be held by any state body.

(Added by Stats.1987, c. 1320, § 4.)